DUKES COUNTY HISTORICAL SOCIETY
OFFICERS OF THE SOCIETY

ALFRED HALL ... President
GALE HUNTINGTON ... Vice President
JOHN W. OSBORN ... Treasurer
DAVID T. HUGO ... Secretary

Council

DR. SIDNEY N. RIGGS ... Term expires 1971
ADELINE H. RAPPAPORT ... Term expires 1971
LYDIA HOWES DREW ... Term expires 1970
DOROTHY COTTLLE POOLE ... Term expires 1970
DORRIS S. HOUGH ... Term expires 1969
NELSON COON ... Term expires 1969

DOROTHY R. SCOVILLE ... Curator
GEORGE H. CHASE ... General Counsel
LYDIA HOWES DREW ... Genealogist
HENRY BEETLE HOUGH ... Historian
DR. SIDNEY N. RIGGS ... Cover Artist
GALE HUNTINGTON ... Acting Editor, Intelligencer

DUES
Active membership ... $5.00 annual dues
Active husband and wife membership ... $8.00 annual dues
Sustaining membership ... $10.00 annual dues
Life membership ... $100.00

PLEASE - give us your change of address promptly to save postage and
injure arrival of every issue of the Intelligencer.

The Intelligencer will be mailed free to all members of the Society. Non-
members may purchase it for fifty cents a copy.

This Society is supported entirely by membership dues, gifts, and bequests.

Your gift or bequest will be deeply appreciated and should be made payable

to the "Dukes County Historical Society, Inc." All such contributions are
deductible under Federal Income Tax Law.

Material from the Intelligencer may be republished provided that credit is
given to the author and to the Dukes County Historical Society.

---

Death's Heads, Cherubs, Urn and Willow:
A Stylistic Analysis of Martha’s Vineyard Tombstones

by

JAMES B. RICHARDSON III

Editorial Note:

Dr. James B. Richardson III is an assistant Professor of Anthropology at the university
of Pittsburg.

He has done archaeological fieldwork in South Dakota, New York, Massachusetts and Peru, and was part of the team directed by Dr. William A. Ritchie of the New York State Museum which carried out a series of archaeological excavations on Martha's Vineyard between 1964 and 1967. He also conducted excavations and research on man’s earliest occupation of northwest Peru.

Members of Dr. Richardson’s family have been summer and year round residents of
the Island for four generations.

Stay Reader yet a moment
mind what this speaking stone doth say.
Remember you was born to die
as well as she who here doth lie.
Then as she chose the better Part
and gave he SAVIOUR all her Heart,
joy'n her Choice, your Heart resign,
and Life Eternal shall be thine
(Mary Newman, 1755 - Burial Hill)

Introduction

The recent studies of James Deetz and Edwin S. Dethlefsen (1967), Alan I.
Ludwig (1966) and the pioneer study of Harriet Forbes (1927) have demonstrated that there are three basic universal designs which appear on the slate tombstones of New England: the Death's Head, Cherub, and Urn and Willow. The Death's Head is characterized by a winged skull and is found on the earliest tablets. The succeeding Cherub style is a depiction of a human face with wings and the last of these universal motifs to spread throughout the Northeast was the Urn and Willow Tree. These major styles can be further subdivided into substyles and many of the tombstones can be attributed to specific carvers which give us a clue on Martha's Vineyard of the effect of “off-island” influence on the religious values of the times. This study was undertaken to determine if the replacement of tombstone designs followed
the same general pattern on Martha's Vineyard as in the Boston region, the point of their initial introduction.

The Martha's Vineyard Cemeteries

Eleven cemeteries were utilized in this study, several of which are small family plots. Only the slate tablets in each of these cemeteries were used to develop a stylistic development of tombstone motifs and they date to between 1688 and 1829. The following cemeteries were utilized in this study:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cemetery</th>
<th>Town</th>
<th>Earliest Stone</th>
<th>Motif</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burial Hill</td>
<td>Edgartown</td>
<td>John Coffin 1711</td>
<td>Death's Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pease Point Way</td>
<td>Edgartown</td>
<td>Mary Visson 1781</td>
<td>Death's Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayhew Plot</td>
<td>Edgartown</td>
<td>Matthew Mayhew 1714</td>
<td>Death's Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oak Grove</td>
<td>Oak Bluffs</td>
<td>Benjamin Claghorn 1759</td>
<td>Death's Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Franklin and</td>
<td>Vineyard Haven</td>
<td>Abigail Daggett 1770</td>
<td>Cherub</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center St.</td>
<td>Vineyard Haven</td>
<td>Benjamin Mayhew 1717</td>
<td>Death's Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crossways</td>
<td>Vineyard Haven</td>
<td>Elizabeth Holmes 1791</td>
<td>Cherub</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holmes-Dunham</td>
<td>Vineyard Haven</td>
<td>Lydia Norton 1771</td>
<td>Death's Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lamberts Cove</td>
<td>West Tisbury</td>
<td>John Mayhew 1688</td>
<td>Death's Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Tisbury</td>
<td>West Tisbury</td>
<td>Benjamin Skiffe 1717</td>
<td>Death's Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chilmark</td>
<td>Oak Bluffs</td>
<td>Henry Norton 1764</td>
<td>Cherub</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Death's Heads

The earliest known example of the Death's Head style is on the John Mayhew (1688) stone in the West Tisbury cemetery (Plate 2). The side panels of this stone as well as the John Coffin (1711) stone at Burial Hill are of interest since this is a case of erotic symbolism. The panels portray human breasts, which in the literature of the Puritan period symbolizes the divine milk with which to nourish the soul (Ludwig 1966:155). This motif also appears on the Lamson stones (plate 2). Floral designs and flowering vines are, however, the most common decoration on the side panels of the Death's Head stones and are symbolic of life (ibid: 142). Another common motif is an hourglass above the skull indicating that the sands of time have run out. The only occurrence of the hourglass motif is found on the John Coffin (1711) stone in Burial Hill. Crossbones, indicative of death, can be observed on the Susanah Mayhew (1758) and Col. Zacheus Mayhew (1760) stones in Chilmark; the Deacon Jonathon Luce (1763), West Tisbury and on the Mary Norton (1781) stone in the Burial Hill cemetery.

Little is known of the carvers of the Martha's Vineyard tombstones, however the distinctive motifs of several "off-Island" carvers are evident. Two elaborate skulls (without wings) and crossbones decorate the stones of Matthew Mayhew (1775) and Mayhew Mayhew (1785) in the Chilmark cemetery. These two stones appear to be the work of John Homer (b. 1727 - d. 1803) of Boston who, between 1758 and 1797 carved at least forty stones using this design, apparently his only motif. The Paul Fitcomb (1773) stone in the Newburyport cemetery and the Tobias Lear (1781) stone in the Portsmouth, New Hampshire cemetery are examples of his work and are similar to the Mayhew stones (Forbes 1927:65-67, see plate facing p. 64).

A large number of Death's Heads on the Island can be attributed to the Lamson family of Charlestown (Plate 2). The father, Joseph Lamson (b. 1658 - d.?) and two sons, Nathaniel (b. 1693 - d. 1755) and Caleb (b. 1697 - d. 1769) and Nathaniel's son Joseph (b. 1760 - d. 1808) carved tombstone for over one hundred and fifty years. All of the Lamson stones are of thick banded red to violet banded slate and the backs of the stones are invariably rough and unpolished. The skulls have deeply carved and curving eyebrows and in many cases there is a floral motif set into a rosette above the skull (plate 2). The lettering on the stones is exactly the same as well as many of the side panels and the wings are usually down-sweeping and slightly curving. The Benjamin Smith (1720) stone in Burial Hill; the Mrs. Chase (1746) in the Crossways and the John Manter (1744) stone in West Tisbury cemeteries are examples of the Lamson style (see Fig. 2 for a seriation of the Lamson stones). The Lamson stones on the Island are most probably the work of Nathaniel and Caleb Lamson since their father Joseph carved more elaborate stones which are restricted mainly to the Boston region (Forbes 1927:40-49, see plates facing pp. 44, 45 and 48).

In the Chilmark cemetery there are three Death's Heads which are the work of the Situate carver (name unknown) (Mary Skiffe 1724, Nathaniel Skiffe 1725 and John Skiffe 1728). The upper ends of each side panel are rosettes made up of little triangles with a scroll beneath (see plate 3). The lettering and carvings on the Skiffe stones are identical to the John Vinal (1698) and Nathaniel Pitcher (1723) stones in the Situate cemetery (Forbes 1927: plates facing pp. 81, 86 and 87).

Cherubs

The earliest Cherubs on the Island are to be found in the West Tisbury cemetery, and may represent attempts at portraiture of the deceased individual. The later Cherubs from about 1745 to 1804 become stylized and a
series of distinct substyles occur - all internally consistent in design. These early "personalized" cherubs, with human faces, mark the graves of high status individuals in the Cambridge area and on the Island. The Cherub motif was introduced into Boston by a distinct social class (doctors, professors, governors, etc.) who were more receptive to the English style of the times. Deetz and Dethlefsen (1967:33) have noted that the diffusion of the Cherub style from its center of introduction (Boston) was relatively slow and did not appear in cemeteries in the Plymouth area until the 1750's. Although the Cherub style did not begin to submerge the Death's Head motifs until after 1750 on the Island, there are a limited number of early Cherub stones that suggest that the diffusion of the Cherub style from Boston to the Island began soon after its introduction from England. The introduction of the Cherub motif to the Island was most probably by way of sea lanes from Boston to the Island and not overland and thus a direct introduction from its initial source. The earliest Cherub is that of Doctor Thomas West (1706) in the West Tisbury cemetery. This stone has a very human looking face, one of the wings is folded and the side panels have intricately carved floral designs.

The James Allen (1714) stone (plate 4) in the West Tisbury cemetery is a combination of both the Death's Head and Cherub designs. The Death's Head is carved above that of the Cherub which is the dominant motif. The only other "personalized" Cherubs are in the West Tisbury cemetery (Benjamin Russell 1712/13) and in Burial Hill (Thomas Harlock 1744).

In the Chilmark Cemetery the earliest personalized Cherub is the Ebenezer Allen (1733) stone (plate 5). The finest stone of this type is that of Elizabeth Bosworth (1747) which has an angel on each wing armed with spears, a symbol of death (plate 6). The central portion of the face of this stone has been defaced. Other elaborate Cherubs can be seen on the Joseph Mayhew (1782) stone (chief judge of Dukes County) (plate 7) which is similar to one of the Luke Roberts (1780) stone in a Boston Cemetery (Gillon 1966: plate 174). The Jonathan Allen (1784) stone seems to be the work of Henry Christian Geyer of Boston and is similar to the John Coleman (1771) stone in the Granary, Boston (Forbes: 1927: 62-65, plates facing p. 60).

A limited number of further "personalized" Cherubs (e.g. Lucy Mayhew 1797, Pease Pt. Way and Benjamin Allen 1791, West Tisbury) occur in the 1790's in Martha's Vineyard cemeteries, but these are not as elaborate as the above mentioned examples.

The remaining Cherubs which predominate in the Island cemeteries can be subdivided into four major substyles. All of the stones within each substyle are internally consistent in design with very little variation in style. In all these substyles the Cherubs have lost their human qualities and have become stylized to the point that they appear to have been mass produced.

The first of these stylized winged Cherubs is characterized by a round face with slightly raised oblong eyes and a complete lack of hair (plate 8), and the side panels of all these stones bear similar scrolls. The earliest appears in the Crossways Cemetery in 1728 (John Pieber) and the design remains relatively unchanged to its last appearance on the Content Luce (1773) stone in the West Tisbury Cemetery (see fig. 2 for seriation).

Beginning in 1750 (the Mary Manter stone in West Tisbury) the second substyle is introduced to the Island. Many of these Cherubs have partial bodies and all have an oblong face with circular eyes and a distinctive hairdo (see plates 9, 10). The majority have the words Memento Mori or Memento Mori (as I am now, so you must be) inscribed above the head on a separate panel or rarely on a panel beneath the Cherub. Many of these Cherubs have "teardrops" carved on the background surrounding the face as do many of the Cherubs of the following substyle 3. The latest of the substyle 2 stones is in the Chilmark Cemetery (Elizabeth Norton 1791) (see fig. 2 for seriation). This style of Cherub is distributed throughout Eastern Massachusetts, Rhode Island and Cape Cod (see Gillon 1966, plate 163 and 175 for examples from Rhode Island).

The third substyle is that of Cherubs with a V shaped hairdo projecting down upon the forehead with no hair on top of the head as in substyle 2 (plate 11). The wings are usually spread out from the head as in substyle 2, however there are several examples of Cherubs of this style with down-pointing wings as in plate 12 (e.g. the Capt. Benjamin Coffin (1793) stone in the Pease Point Way Cemetery). The majority of these stones also have the inscription Memento Mori carved on them and the eyes of this style are exactly like that of substyle 2. The stones upon which these Cherubs are carved take various top forms (see plate 12), an innovation in stone shape which is first introduced during this period; the design corresponding to the shape of the top of the stone. The earliest representation of this style is on the Ebenezer Norton (1769) stone in the Burial Hill Cemetery and the latest is the Sarah Kelley (1801) stone in the Pease Point Way Cemetery (see fig. 2 for seriation). An interesting double stone (Barnard and Dorothy Case, 1792) of this style can be seen in the West Tisbury Cemetery.

The fourth substyle is characterized by an oval smiling face, oval eyes and tightly curled hair which encompasses half the head (plate 13). The earliest stone of this style is that of Mary Walrond (1751) in the West Tisbury
Cemetery and last stone of substyle 4 can be seen on the Hannabel D. Luce (1803) stone in the Franklin and Center Street Cemetery.

There are two Cherub stones in the Pease Point Way Cemetery that are carved on sandstone slabs and have designs which have been introduced from the Connecticut Valley region. The earliest of these sandstones winged Cherubs is the Susanna Bunker (1786) stone. The other is the badly eroded slab of Richard Glovehosmer (?) of Middletown, Conn. (1796) which has a winged Cherub with crown upon its head. The Cherub motifs on these two stones are typical of the winged Cherubs found throughout the Connecticut Valley (i.e. Longmeadow, Mass., cemetery).

Three examples of the “Medusa” style are found on the Island (Elizah Smith 1777, Lambert’s Cove and Temple Cook 1764 and John Cooke 1766 in the Burial Hill Cemetery) (plate 14). Stones of this style occur throughout southeastern Massachusetts and Cape Cod and are exclusively found marking the graves of infants or children (Deetz and Delfsen 1967:36). The carving of this style has been attributed to Ebenezer Soule (b. 1710, d. 1792) of Plympton (Ludwig 1966:355).

Ur:n and Willow

The earliest example of the Urn and Willow motif on the Island is in the Chilmark Cemetery (Samuel Tilton, 1770) followed in 1771 by the Richard Gray stone in the West Tisbury Cemetery. However, it is not until after 1796 that the Urn and Willow designs become popular on the Island. The majority of the Urn and Willow designs are a simple outline of an Urn and Willow carved on a light gray stone (plate 15). The remaining Urn and Willows fall into a number of substyles. The first is represented by an Urn and Willow which looks like a drooping feather (i.e. Jemimah Davis 1799, Oak Grove). There are also a number of outlines of “ribbed” Urns with a flame or circular finial on top and an elaborate willow tree (e.g. Mary Pool, 1806; Matthew Mayhew 1805; the double ribbed Urn and Willow of the Harriet and Martha Mayhew (1806) stone in the Chilmark Cemetery; Moriah Norton 1807, Shubael Cottle 1808 in the Lambert’s Cove Cemetery, etc.). All of these “ribbed” urns are basically restricted to the period between 1804 and 1810. Although there are a number of unique Urn and Willow stones on the Island, the only other style that can be seen is that of a circular urn with a conical cap and willow tree (John Manchester 1811, Franklin and Center; Pernel Mayhew 1808, Chilmark; Depsy Luce 1810, Lambert’s Cove and Johnathon Pease, 1818, Pease Point Way Cemetery).

There are also occurrences of single willows and single urns; many of which are marking the graves of infants and children and occasionally an adult. There are twenty-five single urns on the Island dating between 1795-1819 with twenty-three of the examples falling between 1800-1809. There are eleven single willows dating between 1805-1819 with ten examples falling between 1810-1819. (e.g. single urns; Mary Rotch, 1816, Lambert’s Cove, and single willow; Capt. Thomas Beetle, 1803, Edgartown and Robert Allen 1801, Chilmark).

Two of the Urn and Willow period stones are signed J. Bagley, Sculp’t, Providence (R.I.), the Capt. Nathan Smith (1805) stone in the Lambert’s Cove cemetery (see Elvin 1963:43, for a photo of this stone) and the Daniel Vincent (1806) stone in the Pease Point Way Cemetery. These two stones are the only known stones to have been signed by their carver, although many can be attributed to a particular carver due to their stylistic similarities as previously noted.

On several of the stones of this period there occurs the inscription O’Death on the Urn (Ebenezer Allen 1803, Crossways, John Pease 1804, Pease Point Way - plate 17) or the Masonic emblem, (John Haskell, 1806, Pease Point Way).

The most elaborate Urn and Willow stone on the Island is the Polly Manter (1817) stone in the West Tisbury Cemetery (see plate 16 and Gillon 1966: plate 76), which depicts a woman weeping over an urn.

Sun Rays and Orbs

The Sun Ray and Orb style first appears in an elaborate form in the Lambert’s Cove Cemetery on the Mary Cottle (1774) and Amy Cottle (1780) stones. A half sun orb, complete with eyes and bushy eyebrows and seven rays emanating from the top of the orb can be seen on both stones and were carved by the same sculptor. The Samuel Wiswall (1782) stone in the Edgartown Cemetery is also the product of this same carver (name unknown) since its design (a floral motif) is an exact duplicate of the footstone of the Amy Cottle stone and carries the same ropelike side panels. It is carved on the same light gray slate. The use of Sun Rays and Orbs has a specific meaning as either a symbol of resurrection or as glorified souls (Ludwig 1965:189).

In 1795 (Thomas Davis, Oak Grove) the first green slate stone with a semi-circular orb and nine rays makes its appearance on the Island (plate 18). Between 1800 and 1809 thirty-six of these identical types of stones became popular for marking the graves of the deceased. There are two sizes of this style, a large and a small. The large stone is found marking adults’ graves and the small stones are invariably found over the graves of children. (The Luce stone in the Crossways Cemetery marks the graves of four children of Capt.
Johnathon and Mrs. Luce who died between 1793 and 1804. Examples of the Sun Ray and Orb stones can be seen on the Isaac Chase (1803) stone, Lambert’s Cove; James Winslow (1805), Crossways; Frederic Allen (1806), Chilmark; Abigail Luce (1803), West Tisbury; Joseph Luce (1806), Crossways and Sarah Norton (1804), Pease Point Way.

This unknown carver was not restricted to Sun Rays and Orbs, but also carved single urns, a number of which have a small Sun Ray and Orb at the top of the stone (e.g. John Pease, 1804, Pease Point Way, plate 17).

Revival Styles

Recently there has been a revival in the use of slate for gravestones which can be graphically seen in the Burial Hill Cemetery. Within the past few years, this earliest of the Island cemeteries is again being utilized as a burial ground. There are also several new slate stones which duplicate in form the early stones in the Chilmark Cemetery. In keeping with the early stones in the first of the Island Cemeteries, the new gravestones are of slate and shaped essentially like the old stones in order to maintain continuity in the form from the old to the new.

The use of slate gravestones is also becoming popular on the mainland. In the Amherst, Massachusetts Cemetery, the Emerson Endicott Strong (1957) stone is exactly the same in stone, shape and exact design (a single urn) as the Nehemiah Strong (1779) and Mrs. Nehemiah Strong (1761) stones. These old stones were probably rubbed by a modern carver and reduplicated on the E. E. Strong stone.

Indian Graves

The Island was settled in 1642 by a small group of settlers under the leadership of Thomas Mayhew Jr. who was subsequently ordained a minister. He immediately began to Christianize the Wampanoag Indians and within a decade several hundred Indians had been converted. By 1669 a permanent Christian mission had been established at Christian Town and, in this earliest of Christian Indian cemeteries, the graves are marked by a large boulder for a headstone and a small boulder for the footstone (See Travers 1960: 44 for a photo of this cemetery). The use of a head and footstone for the marking of graves is the direct result of the introduction of Christianity to the Island, since there is no known prehistoric use of gravemarkers of this type by Indians in the Northeastern United States.

In 1693 the Indian Baptist Church was erected at Gay Head and nearby there is a cemetery with boulder head and footstones marking Christian graves. There are also a number of other cemeteries marked in the same manner in the Gay Head area. The present cemetery, appropriately called the New Cemetery, is still used by the descendants of the Wampanoag Indians. In this cemetery the use of boulder head and footstones remains the predominant method of marking the graves; only a small proportion of the graves is marked by carved tombstones. Thus there is a continuity of grave marking among the Christian Wampanoag Indians from the 1660's to the present time; a pattern which has remained unchanged for over 300 years.

Conclusions

All of the slate stones had to be imported to the Island since there are no sources of slate to be found on Martha's Vineyard, and it would appear that most of the carving on these tombstones was executed by carvers in Boston or Eastern Massachusetts area and ordered by Island families from particular off-Island carvers when one of their members passed away. To verify our assumption that the majority of the tombstones were imported to the Island throughout the period under study, a search of the probate records would have to be undertaken to determine from whom the stones were ordered.

Ludwig (1966) and Deetz and Dethlefsen (1967) have correlated the change in the universal tombstone design (Death's Heads, Cherubs, and Urn and Willow) with the changing religious values in New England. The Death's Head is a graphic reminder of death and resurrection and a stylistic expression of orthodox Puritanism. It further emphasizes the mortality of man and stresses decay and life's brevity. With the decline of Puritanism and the Great Awakening of the middle 1750's the more angelic Cherub style spread from England to Boston and then throughout New England with a stress on resurrection and later heavenly reward. The final shift to Urn and Willow designs may be correlated with the rise in the Boston area of less emotional, more intellectual religious thinking such as the Universalist and Unitarian movements.

There is also a corresponding shift in the beginning description on the stones of these styles. On the Death's Heads stones the opening line is "Here lies. . ." or "Here lies buried. . ." which is replaced by "Here lies buried the body of. . ." during the Cherub period and by "In the memory of. . ." or "Sacred to the memory of. . ." in the Urn and Willow period.

Figure 1 is a type frequency graph which illustrates the popularity and replacement of the three universal styles (Death's Heads, Cherubs, and Urn and Willow). The numbers of stones used in this study for each five year period are also included.

In 1688 the first Death's Head (John Mayhew, West Tisbury) makes its
appearance on the Island, followed fifteen years later by another single example of a Death's Head and a Cherub (Dr. Thomas West, 1706, West Tisbury). By 1760 the Cherub style begins to submerge the Death's Head in popularity. It is interesting to note that, although by 1785 the Cherubs form the dominant motif in all of the Island cemeteries, a few Death's Heads are still in evidence. Between 1800-04 the Death’s Heads and Cherub styles abruptly end. The reason for the sudden demise of the Cherub style (13 examples between 1800-04) may be due to the rising popularity of the Sun Ray and Orb style as well as that of the Urn and Willow. The earliest Urn and Willow motifs occur between 1775-79 (two examples) followed in twenty years (1795) by a major influx of Urn and Willows, which by 1805 became (along with the Sun Ray and Orb) the only style executed on the slate stones. Although the Urn and Willow motif appears to die out in 1829, there are examples from later periods to be found on marble tablets (which were not used in this brief study).

The study of tombstones is providing the anthropologist with a wealth of information concerning the processes of culture change as evidenced in the changing design patterns through time. These changes in the three universal styles reflect the changes in the religious values of the times as seen in the beliefs on death.

Boston was the cultural, religious and political center for most of eastern Massachusetts in the 1800's and since Harvard provided the Island with the majority of its early ministers, new religious values initially introduced into Boston from England were felt soon after on Martha's Vineyard.
Plate 7: Joseph Mayhew, 1782, Chilmark

Plate 8: George Manter, 1766, West Tisbury

Plate 9: Mary Manter, 1750, West Tisbury

Plate 10: Elizabeth Jenkins, 1772, Burial Hill
Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge my indebtedness to Judy H. Richardson, J. B. Richardson, Jr., Kathleen Ney and Gale Huntington for their aid and support of this study. I further wish to express my deep gratitude to Miriam D. Richardson for her long hours spent in recording and rubbing gravestones which form the basic data presented in this paper.

Bibliography

Deetz, James and Edwin S. Dethlefsen
1967 Death's Heads, Cherubs, and Urn and Willow. 

Dethlefsen, Edwin S. and James Deetz
1966 Death's Heads, Cherubs, and Willow Trees: Experimental Archaeology in Colonial Cemeteries. 

Elvin, Joseph B.
1963 The Lambert's Cove Cemetery. The Dukes County Intelligencer, 
Vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 39-47.

Forbes, Harriet

Gillon, Edmund

Ludwig, Allan I.

Travers, Milton A.
1960 The Wampanoag Indian Tribute Tribes of Martha's Vineyard. 

A Faire Island for Martha

by

HAROLD C. WILSON

Editorial Note:

Mr. Wilson has been a teacher in the Belmont and Falmouth school systems. He is currently presenting a lecture series on Bartholomew Gosnold in schools and to professional groups. He has done research on Gosnold in the library of the Dukes County Historical Society where there is considerable manuscript material on Gosnold by both Warner F. Goodkin and Marshall Shepard.

The brave sea captain, Bartholomew Gosnold, had just returned from his latest privateering venture against the Spanish, anxious to renew his involvement with England's colonial ambitions in America. The future pathfinder to New England was convinced that his country's destiny lay with its success in the New World.

The year was 1599, and Sir Walter Raleigh's previous failures at Roanoke left the English people in a state of bewilderment. Many lives had been lost and the steady drain of money from the Queen's treasury to support colonization attempts had taken its toll.

However, a renewed effort at colonization was a necessity. The Spanish were now thinking of expanding their claims to the northern parts of the American coast; and to compound the problem, the French were firmly situated in Newfoundland and other maritime provinces and could easily drift southward, if they wished. England's claim on Aboriginal America, under Raleigh's charter would prove of little value if action was not initiated immediately.

Richard Hakluyt, the great propagandist of English overseas expansion, had finally convinced certain influential people on the idea of another attempt at planting a colony. Captain Gosnold because of his already valuable sea experience, and more so because of his connections with the Merchant Adventures was considered by Hakluyt and others an ideal choice to lead the intended expedition. It was almost a year since his youngest daughter, Martha, had died at the age of only eighteen months from an unknown malady. In fact he only recently had been notified of the tragedy, because of his absence at sea.

The young adventurer, saddened by this great personal loss, and with fond
memories of his child close to his heart, engrossed himself with the business at hand; that of helping to organize a plan to send a reconnaissance voyage to America.

Early in 1602, events happened quickly. Henry Wriothesley, the Earl of Southampton, and some prominent merchant adventurers from Bristol agreed to go along with the scheme if a goodly profit would result from the trip. The financiers agreed that the expedition should attempt to prove that the arguments presented by Richard Hakluyt for colonization were practicable.

The great British geographer convinced the promoters that Norumbega (New England) should be their "proposed place." They should find that "great broad river" located on the parallel of forty degrees north latitude which Giovanni Da Verrazzano visited in 1524. A fort and trading station should be established at the entrance to this great bay which would be the first of many such installations that would eventually protect future colonists along the eastern seaboard of America and therefore block the French and Spanish from infiltrating these shores. Hakluyt insisted that the ship's company should include men expert in minerals; the art of fortification; husbandry; and farming to determine the feasibility of planting. Also men who knew fishing and plant life should perform careful investigations which could later prove beneficial for trade. It was hoped that the climate would be suitable for Englishmen. An effort to establish friendly relations with the Indians would make it easier to convert these pagans to the Gospel. The trip could be accomplished in as little as five weeks, using the direct route across the Atlantic Ocean. This certainly would convince the merchants that two, possibly three, trading voyages could be accomplished within a year's time.

Soon, twenty-three gentlemen and eight sailors were selected, many of them by Captain Gosnold; and on March 26th, 1602, the frail bark of Dartmouth, called the Concord, probably a veteran of one of Sir Francis Drake's excursions, slipped out, unnoticed from Falmouth harbor in Cornwall, destined to reopen the doors to English colonization of America.

Less than seven weeks later, in the early morning of May 14th, the Concord sighted land off the southern coast of Maine. Indians came out to visit the explorers and a friendly exchange of goods was passed. The next day, the ship proceeded to drift southward until its path was blocked by a "mighty headland." Captain Gosnold with some of his company went ashore and climbed the highest hill they could find in order to get a better view of the area and try to determine their exact location. From probably what was Shootflying Hill in Barnstable, the Captain could see that he was on a large cape that extended east and then northeast out into the Atlantic. He also thought he saw his "proposed place" or destination; that being the extreme eastern portion of present day Martha's Vineyard. This point, together coinciding with the mainland, that ran southwesterly, appeared to be an opening to a large river or bay.

Returning to the ship late in the afternoon of that day, Gosnold found that the sailors had caught a considerable amount of cod fish; in fact, so many that a number of them had to be thrown overboard again. In their joy at discovering this great fishing ground, the entire company in unison, named the place "Cape Cod."

But the intrepid captain was anxious to move on and investigate the shore south of this headland. Therefore the Concord weighed anchor and rounded the cape that night, which is no easy task, even for modern day sailors. Finding dangerous shoal water close to the land, Gosnold decided to make a wide swing south-southeasterly away from the coast and then cautiously approach the mainland from the south. This took the Concord around the island of Nantucket, whereby with some difficulty, the little ship managed to negotiate the southern opening to Nantucket Sound, now known as Muskeget Channel. Reaching a point off Monomoy Island, they now changed course and proceeded to coast southwesterly along the southern shores of Cape Cod. This action took almost five days to be completed.

We now can place the Concord, on the afternoon of May 21st, a mile or two off-shore, approaching the eastern entrance to Vineyard Sound with the island of Martha's Vineyard to port.

William Strachey, a contemporary of Gosnold, wrote an account of the proceedings; and at that precise moment in the Captain's search, in one paragraph he seems to clear away once and for all, the questions concerning what islands Bartholomew named and for what reasons he named them.

"At length they came amongst many fair islands, three especially, those which they had discerned upon the land, all lying within a league or two of another, and not above six or seven leagues from the main; the one whereof Captain Gosnoll called Marthaes Viniard, being stored with such an incredible number of vines, as well in the woody part of the island where they ran upon every tree, as on the outward parts, that they could not go for treading upon them; the second full of deer and fowl and glittering mineral stones, he called by his own name, Gosnoll's Island; the third about some sixteen miles in compass, containing many pieces and necks of land little difference from

---

1 Discourse On Western Planting by Richard Hakluyt, Chap. XX Old South Leaflets Vol. V, p. 444.
several islands, saving that certain banks of small breadth, life bridges, seem to join them to this island, he called Elizabeth Island.”

Gosnold monument on Cuttyhunk. It was erected in honor of the first Englishman to visit New England, and was dedicated September 1, 1903.

It is noted that John Brereton and Gabriel Archer, gentlemen aboard the Concord, wrote eyewitness accounts of the voyage that were later published in England. It is certain that Strachey used parts of both of these narratives in his “Historie of Travel into Virginia Britania.” However, if one studies Archer’s and Brereton’s relations carefully, there is found considerable evidence

that the authors gave a distorted image of their real findings, with the possible intent of confusing other potential competitors. Strachey, on the other hand, later being Secretary of the Virginia Company at Jamestown from 1607 to 1610, had occasion to discuss the matter with others who had gone with Captain Gosnold to New England. This, no doubt, gave him a clearer picture of what actually happened and he incorporated these findings into his own


work which was published in 1612. Therefore, taking into account these factors and relying on Strachey's more direct approach, it is apparent that the three islands named by Gosnold were:

MARTHA'S VINEYARD - now called by its old Indian name, Chappaquiddick
GOSNOLL'S ISLAND - present day Martha's Vineyard
ELIZABETH ISLAND - Cuttyhunk and Nashawena Islands joined together

What a fitting act of devotion, for Bartholomew to name the smaller island with its berry bushes in full bloom and rambling grape vines, in favor of his cherished daughter whom he had lost a few years earlier; and then calling the much larger island, next to it, with its bold coast and an abundance of natural wealth, for himself. Indeed a living tribute of his affection for Martha; and as a final note, naming his destination, with anticipations of success in his enterprise, for his favorite sister, Elizabeth Gosnold Tilney.

After their landing at Cuttyhunk, the entire company called "the most magnificent sound that they ever saw", protected by low lying hills on both sides, GOSNOLD'S HOPE, in respect for their gallant captain. (author's note; now called by the injudicious name of Buzzards Bay)

The first three weeks of June found the explorers investigating the area, to determine if it was suitable for colonization. Extensive examinations of the flora and fauna proved that the soil was fertile for farming. A fort and storehouse were built at Cuttyhunk which commanded the entrance to both Vineyard Sound and Gosnold's Hope (Bay). Trade was established with the Indians. A cordial atmosphere seemed to prevail between the inhabitants and the Englishmen. On exploring the coastline, within the bay, Gosnold found many inlets and harbors that would be ideal for settlers. Describing the landscape, probably near modern day Woods Hole, Brereton writes: "We stood awhile like men ravished at the beauty and delicacy of this sweet soil; for besides divers clear lakes of fresh water (whereof we saw no end) Meadows very large and full of green grass; even the most woody places (I speak only of such I saw) do grow so distinct and apart, one tree from another, upon green grassie ground, somewhat higher than the plains, as if nature would show herself above her power artificial." 1

Gosnold, after his return to England, wrote to his father saying: "We cannot gather, by anything we could observe in the people or by any trial we had thereof ourselves, but that it is as healthful a climate as can be. The inhabitants there, as I wrote before, being of tall stature, comely proportion, strong, active, and some of good years, and as it should seem very healthful, are sufficient proof of the healthfulness of the place." 1

The company prepared for their return by loading the hold of the Concord with cedar logs, some furs and especially sassafras, a product used for medicinal purposes in Europe, a ton of which would bring a small fortune back in England.

Gosnold wanted to stay behind with eleven others and hold the place until a larger force could return with supplies and possibly more colonists. However, among other reasons, the men had a great underlying fear of possible reprisal from the Indians, probably with the disasters at Roanoke still fresh in their minds. This convinced the Captain that it would be wise to abandon the place for the time being, at least. Strachey relates: "Captain Gosnold was faine to yield to the present necessity and leaving this island with many sorrowful, loth to depart, about the midst of June, weyed, with fair winds, and the midst of July arrived again, safe in Exmouth; in five months thus finishing this discovery, and returning with giving many comforts, and those right true ones, concerning the benefit of a plantation in those parts." 2

Indeed, Richard Hakluyt was ever so correct in his vision of a "NEW ENGLAND!" The Concord's achievements would now bring a steady flow of English merchant vessels to America which eventually resulted in the planting of a colony at Plymouth in 1620; a lasting memorial to Gosnold's "Faire New World" and his paradise for Martha.

---


Historical Society News

With a new year fast coming up over the horizon, the old year drops astern and hopefully we scan the skies for weather signs. Last year brought an increasing number of visitors to the museum -- appreciative visitors who often made helpful suggestions, gave valuable information or contributed acquisitions. The general trend toward widening interest in American history was reflected in the Dukes County Historical Society’s museum library where many researchers worked.

Research work is a year round effort at the museum library where Mrs. Bettencourt, librarian, Gale Huntington, archivist, Mrs. Lydia Drew, genealogist and your curator try to provide answers for a variety of queries.

Some interesting correspondence reminiscent of whaling days, has been flying back and forth from Lahaina to Edgartown, all in the interest of a restoration project in that island port of Maui. Once a busy port of call for whalers in the South Pacific, Lahaina’s former Mission Station and Reading Room was supported by many of the Edgartown whaling captains. The husband and wife team of architects working on the restoration, have turned to the Dukes County Historical Society for information associated with the period.

When the Reading Room was voted to be sold in 1846, eight of the 23 whaling captains signing the authorization, were Edgartown men. Old documents in Lahaina show Capt. George Lawrence of the Ship George and Martha, hailing from Edgartown, was a generous contributor. In 1834 he gave four chairs, a looking glass, six yards of duck and a pitcher, all valued at $10.50.

A very choice Swiss music box now is on display in the museum library and visitors as well as staff are enjoying the tinkling airs which range from Il trovatore’s “Anvil Chorus” to “I Dream” from the Bohemian Girl. The handsomely inlaid wood case is 9 ½ by 27 inches, has ornate handles and plays a dozen tunes. It came from the home of Sabra Fisher and is a gift of Stuart Avery.

Mrs. Daniel F. Worth of Berryville, Va., has contributed a collection of old and historically valuable items from her late husband’s effects. He was the son of Capt. Daniel F. Worth and Mrs. Nettie Smith Bassett. An Annapolis graduate, he was in the Navy for many years and served with the Atomic

Energy Commission in charge of the production of the atomic bombs in New Mexico. He died in 1955. Mrs. Worth wrote that she was giving the collection in his memory and also in “loving memory of a remarkable woman, Nettie Smith Bassett Worth, who with great effort, took care and cherished these things of her family and the island.” On his maternal side, Mrs. Worth’s husband was a direct descendant of Governor Mayhew.

In the collection is a journal of the Bark Joshua Loring, on a voyage in 1887 with Capt. Daniel F. Worth, a letter of 1857 from Philip Mayhew to his parents, John Dunham’s journal of 1843, letters to Capt. John Bassett, old Chilmark post office records, photographs and many other invaluable records of the era.

Mr. and Mrs. Robert Waggaman, who have given a number of items to the Society, recently added the journal of a stormy voyage from Boston to Civita Vecchia on the Brig Phebe of Boston, kept by Edmund Bradley and also a letter from Edmund Bradley to David S. Bradley in Westport Point in the 1800’s.

An autographed copy of Sailing Alone Around the World by Joshua Slocum, has been added to the library through the generosity of Mrs. Mary Page St. John of Old Lyme, Conn.

Harold Wilson of Falmouth, often a Vineyard visitor, who is doing research on Bartholomew Gosnold, gave English Privateering Voyages, 1588-95 To The West Indies. The book was edited in 1959 by Kenneth Andrews and published for the Hakluyt Society.

By the time the next edition of the Intelligencer makes appearance, the long winter will be past and the Vineyard will be getting ready for summer. Come see us then!

Dorothy R. Scoville
Curator
Back Issues of the Intelligencer

Issues of the Intelligencer that are still in print may be ordered from the Dukes County Historical Society in Edgartown for fifty cents each. The number and date of the issue with a brief description of the contents follow.

“Two Beaver Hatts” by Dionis Coffin Riggs. The sale of Nantucket by Governor Thomas Mayhew in 1659.
“Genealogy,” by Flavel M. Gifford. A brief listing of some of the sources of Vineyard Genealogy and the families resident on the Island from 1641 to 1699.

“An Archaeological Study from Martha’s Vineyard,” by E.G. Huntington. The description of an amateur archaeological dig at the head of Lagoon Pond, with pen and ink drawings of some of the material found there.

“Vineyard Whaling Captains and Fabulous Frisco,” by Lloyd C.M. Hare. The story of San Francisco as a whaling port, and some of the Vineyard whalers who sailed from there.

“Diurnal Records for the Year 1813,” by Rebecca Smith. The romantic diary of a Vineyard girl at the time of the war of 1812.
“Poems,” by Hannah Smith. The Vineyard has produced more than its share of good poets, and Hannah Smith of Pohogonut was not the least of them.

“Vineyard Meeting Houses,” by Dr. Sidney N. Riggs. A study of the Island’s Methodist, Baptist and Congregational churches, illustrated with fourteen of the author’s charming woodcuts.

“The Episcopal Churches of Martha’s Vineyard,” by Dr. Sidney N. Riggs. A brief study of the Island’s Episcopal churches illustrated with three woodcuts.
“The 125th Anniversary of Wesleyan Grove Camp Meeting.” This consists mainly of extracts from Rev. Hebron Vincent’s A History of the Wesleyan Grove, Martha’s Vineyard, Camp Meeting.
“Diurnal Records for the Year 1813,” by Rebecca Smith. (continued.)


“The Singing Tiltons and Some of Their Songs,” by E.G. Huntington. Nine folksongs from the Vineyard and a few words about the singers.
“Diurnal Records for the Year 1813,” by Rebecca Smith. (continued.)

“Merrily They Rolled Along - On Skates - Five Miles at Sea,” by C. Nelson Bishop. The story of roller skating and the roller skating rink in Oak Bluffs in the 1880’s.
“Sand Dunes and Sea Law,” by Stanley King. Massachusetts riparian law, particularly as it applies to the great ponds of Martha’s Vineyard, and some of the history of the Riparian Association of Chilmark Pond.

“The Peddle Cart,” by Flavel M. Gifford. Some of the history of the peddle cart of the S.M. Mayhew Co. store of West Tisbury. The cart is now preserved on the grounds of the Society in Edgartown.
“Rounding Cape Horn,” by Elon O. Huntington. Extracts from a journal of a merchant voyage on a square rigger from New York City to San Francisco in 1892.


“Adventure On St. Augustine’s Island,” by Captain Henry Pease, 2nd. The experiences of a Vineyard whaleman in the South Pacific, and a description of the natives of the Island. 1853.
Vol. IV, No. 1, August, 1962.
"Christian Indians of Colonial Massachusetts," by Dr. Sidney N. Riggs. This is a valuable paper as showing the contact between Indians and English - two completely different cultures.

"Recollections of Many Years," by Arthur W. Davis. Personal and historical memories by one of the Island's best remembered jurists.

"The Deputy Governor of Martha's Vineyard," by Dr. Charles E. Banks. The "deputy governor" was Hannah, the favorite daughter of Thomas Mayhew.

"The Early Settlement of Martha's Vineyard" (The Pease Tradition,) by Hebron Vincent. This deals with the very old belief that there were English settlers on Martha's Vineyard before the purchase of the Island by Thomas Mayhew.

"The Animal Food Supply of the Vineyard Indians," by E.G. Huntington. This is a brief description - a listing with notes - of some of the animal remains found in archaeological digs on the Island.


"An Island Girlhood One Hundred Years Ago," by Lloyd C.M. Hare. A valuable picture of life on the Vineyard in the past century.


"The Language of Martha's Vineyard," by Annie Daggett Lord. Some Vineyard localisms and peculiar words and expressions formerly used on the Island.


"Dukes County Academy," by Dionis Coffin Riggs. The history of the Island's famous private school in West Tisbury.

"Martha's Vineyard in the 1880's and 1890's," photographs by Richard G. Shute.


"The Fishes In Vineyard Waters," by Joseph B. Elvin. Detailed, and valuable. This paper is good reading for those who never go fishing as well as for fishermen. With line drawings of thirty-six of the varieties of the fishes by Will Huntington.

"The Last Years of the Heath Hen," by Allan Keniston. A personal account of the attempts to save a vanishing species.

"Vineyard Jottings," by Henry Beetle Hough. Some interesting vignettes of Island history by the Society's Historian.


"Martha's Vineyard and the Theatre," by Henry Beetle Hough. This interesting paper deals mainly with people of the theatre who came to the Island as visitors.

"Up-Island, Some Old Photographs and Postcards."
"Loss of the Bark Hecla," by George F. Smith. The account of the loss of a whaleship in 1869. Mr. Smith who tells the story was the vessel's first mate.

"The Wesleyan Grove Camp Ground - Some Old Photographs." These photographs are of the period when the camp ground was still a community of tents.

"Jonathan Mayhew and the Missionary Mayhews," by Doris Cottle Gifford. Jonathan Mayhew was undoubtedly the Vineyard's most renowned son. Mrs. Gifford, who tells the story, is a Mayhew descendant.
"A Letter Home From Herschel Island - 1891," by H. B. Bodfish. Captain Bodfish was one of the most successful of the later Vineyard whalemen. This is a letter he wrote home to his mother from the Arctic where his vessel was frozen in for the winter. It is a valuable human document.

"The Steamer Monohansett and the Hard Winter of 1885," by Captain Charles C. Smith. This account is from Captain Smith's journal and is an interesting account of the actual work of one of the old paddle wheel steamers under very unusual and difficult conditions.

"Plant Life and the Island Colonists," by Nelson Coon. Here one of the country's outstanding horticulturists gives us a picture of a time when plants were a much more important part of everyday life than they are today.

"Three Poems," by Frances Bailey. Had she lived, Frances Bailey might have been a poet not only of Island fame but of world fame. She died at the age of twenty-one.


"A Room From Martha's Vineyard At the Smithsonian Institution," by Rodris Roth. A carefully documented account of a Vineyard family, a Vineyard house, and a now famous room.

"The Loss of the U.S.S. Galena on Gay Head," by Carol W. Kimball. The peculiar details of how a United States warship, while under tow, came to grief on the beach at Gay Head.

"Edgartown - Some Old Photographs."

"Sweep Out The Place When Necessary," by Elden H. Mills. This paper consists of material from the records of the West Tisbury Congregational Church. Dr. Mills is the present minister of the church.

"Animal Remains from Archaeological Sites on Martha's Vineyard," by Joseph H. Waters. This paper is valuable as showing how biology and archaeology can work together to give us a picture of an earlier time.

"Journal 1849-1850," by Anna P. Vinson. A young girl's diary of an important period in Island history. 1849 was the year of the gold rush, it was also just about the heyday of whaling.

"Watercolors by Amelia Watson," with an introduction by Henry Beetle Hough. Here are six watercolors of the Vineyard in the 1880's in full color. Miss Watson was one of the outstanding watercolorists of her time.

"Wonders of the Vineyard," by Carol W. Kimball. The story of excursions from Mystic and New London to Cottage City to witness illumination night in the 1870's.

"Portraits of Some Gay Head People," by Katharine W. Tweed.
Some Publications

OF THE DUKES COUNTY HISTORICAL SOCIETY ON SALE
AT ISLAND BOOK STORES AND IN THE SOCIETY'S LIBRARY.


Our Enchanted Island by Marshall Shepard. An attempt to prove that Martha's Vineyard is the Island of Shakespeare's Tempest. Paper, 50¢.


Tales and Trails of Martha's Vineyard by Joseph C. Allen. 234 p. Illustrated. Paper $3.95. When ordering by mail please add 25¢ to cover postage and handling.