Historic Ship Drawings Found On Boards in Early Houses
by JONATHAN SCOTT

The First Week in the Woods
The First Chapter in the History Of Martha's Vineyard Camp-Meeting
by HENRY BAYLIES

The English and the Indians On Martha's Vineyard
Part IV: Matthew, John and Experience
by ARTHUR R. RAILTON

Documents: Jeremiah Pease Diary
MEMBERSHIP DUES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Membership Type</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>$25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>$40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustaining</td>
<td>$75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patron</td>
<td>$150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Patrons</td>
<td>$250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life membership</td>
<td>$1000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Individual)

Members receive the Intelligencer four times a year.

WINTER HOURS
1 p.m. to 4 p.m.
Wednesday through Friday
10 a.m. to 4 p.m.
Saturday

SUMMER HOURS
(June 15 to Sept. 15)
10 a.m. to 4:30 p.m.
Tuesday through
Saturday

TO DESCENDANTS OF EARLY VINEYARDERS:
Descendants of those families included in Charles E. Banks' History of Martha's Vineyard, Volume III, with information on errors or omissions in his genealogies are asked to inform Catherine Mayhew, Society Genealogist. She is working on a corrected and amended volume. Mrs. Mayhew is also eager for data that will bring the genealogies up to the present to add to the material in our files.

THE DUKES COUNTY INTELLIGENCER

Historic Ship Drawings Found On Boards in Early Houses by Jonathan Scott
115

The First Week in the Woods
The First Chapter in the History Of Martha's Vineyard Camp-Meeting by Henry Baylies
129

The English and the Indians On Martha's Vineyard Part IV: Matthew, John and Experience by Arthur R. Railton
135

Documents: Jeremiah Pease Diary
164

Editor: Arthur R. Railton
Editor Emeritus: Gale Huntington

The Dukes County Intelligencer is published quarterly by the Dukes County Historical Society, Inc., Cooke and School Streets, Edgartown, Massachusetts. Subscription is through membership in the Society. Back issues are available at the Society offices. Memberships are solicited. Applications should be sent to the Society at Box 827, Edgartown, MA, 02539. Manuscripts and authors' queries should also be addressed to that address.

Articles published in The Intelligencer do not necessarily represent the opinions of the Society or its officers. Every effort is made to confirm dates, names and events in published articles, but we cannot guarantee total authenticity.

ISSN 0418 1379
Historic Ship Drawings Found On Boards in Early Houses
by JONATHAN SCOTT

In the process of restoring some early Vineyard houses my construction crew has worked on, we have discovered, often in hidden locations, drawings of vessels that plied these waters many years ago. With a knife or other sharp-pointed instrument, these drawings were etched into paneled walls, floors, and even outside boarding. Some are very lightly scratched, others are more deeply carved and, though they were obviously done by different hands with varying degrees of skill, all are recognizable as vessels common in the era when they were “drawn.” As such, they provide a kind of historical record of vessels sailed in these waters in much earlier times.

It must be remembered that these drawings were not done as works of art. They are more like carved graffiti, done in a very casual way as when perhaps a young Vineyard boy, thinking of ships he had seen, vessels that could carry one to exotic places, might draw them on his bedroom wall. Or when a carpenter, taking a lunch break and needing something to occupy his hands and his thoughts, might pick up a siding board and carve the image of ships he had known or may even have sailed on.

Yet we are surprised at how good and how comprehensible most of the drawings are. Enough detail has survived to allow us to relate them to known ship types of the early Colonial period and slightly later.

JONATHAN F. SCOTT, whose doctoral dissertation is “Early Colonial Houses of Martha’s Vineyard,” is a Professor of Art and Architectural History at Castleton State College in Vermont. He has previously written about old houses in this journal. The present article combines art and architecture, his academic specialties, in a most unusual manner. In summer, besides researching and writing, he runs his Vineyard company that specializes in restoration of buildings. The rest of the year, his son Jonathan is in the boathouse. 
With these drawings, a unique nautical picture begins to emerge of a time so early in Island history that it predates any conscious efforts to record it pictorially. When, for example, in 1671 old Governor Mayhew sailed to New York to negotiate the Island's Royal Charter, or two years later when his grandson Matthew returned with six barrels of "Merchantable Codfish" to deliver as quitrent to Governor Lovelace, no one thought to sketch the vessels they sailed in, nor the one that hailed Matthew before he arrived to tell him that "Yorke was taken by the Dutch." When Judge Sewall of Boston, whose diary gives us one of the early glimpses of Island life, arrived on the Vineyard in 1702, he neglected to describe "Chase's boat," which brought him here. Nor did he tell us anything about the vessel he boarded at Holmes Hole for his "Passage to Roade-Island" in 1706.1

The importance of these simple drawings on boards is that they provide us with our first glimpse of sailing vessels that in much earlier times must have been common in Vineyard waters.

I have tried to date and type the drawings in three ways: 1. through a dating of the houses in which they were found; 2. by relating them, whenever possible, to family members who might have had something to do with ships or the sea; and 3. by comparing them to illustrations and descriptions of known vessels of the period.

What may be the oldest of the drawings was discovered by one of my crew, John Pilson, on the bottom side of a floor board that we had taken up in the back room of the old Hancock-Mitchell house in Quansoo. Readers of the Intelligencer may recognize this house from an article written by my father, the late Henry Scott, in 1981.2 He believed it to be one of the oldest houses on the Island. We had been asked by the owner to re-support and rebuild the floors of the back rooms of the house and to restore these rooms as best we could to something like their original state. In the process, several ship drawings were discovered on the walls of the old kitchen, on a small adjacent bedroom, and on the bottom of the floorboard on the east end of the old kitchen.

There were two layers of wide, pine floorboards in this room (the original kitchen area of the house) and John Pilson found this drawing on a board in the lower, or first layer, facing down. We believe it was a re-used board, being in the later, mid-18th century half of the house, while the drawing shows a much-earlier boat-type. Richard Burt, who made a small dig for clues and artifacts while we had the floor and joist taken out, believes from what he discovered that the older, 17th century, western half of the house was moved to this site some time in the latter half of the 18th century. If this is so, the whole house must have been rebuilt at this time, adding on the eastern half, and doubling the size of the old kitchen or "Great Room," as early Vineyarders called it. The joist clearly show signs that this part of the house had been rebuilt, and it is likely that the floorboard John found was a reused board from the older section of the house.

---

1 See page 161 this issue.
The land, and very probably this older portion of the house, was originally the property of the earliest Mayhew settlers in the region. We know that John Mayhew lived in the Quansoo area from the early 1670s when he acted as both preacher to the Indians and minister for the new pioneer community of (West) Tisbury nearby. Henry Scott suggested that this was John’s house and the early part may once have been the original Indian meeting house constructed by his father, Thomas Mayhew Jr., in 1656.\footnote{Ibid.} While our reconstructions cannot confirm this, we did find evidence of very early house-building practices. The most dramatic were the studs in the outside wall of the small northwest bedroom (off the old kitchen) that were drilled with holes to take the ladder of supports used for wattle-and-daub work. Wattle-and-daub, an early English technique of wall construction, went out of use in this country by the 1680s.

One of five Vineyard examples of this technique that survive from the early Colonial period is found in the restored Vincent house in Edgartown (c. 1672).\footnote{Intelligencer, August 1978, Anne W. Baker, “The Vincent House: Architecture and Restoration,” pp.9-10.} A portion of a former wattle-and-daub wall can also be seen in the (West) Tisbury house of old Isaac Robinson, who was one of the town’s original settlers in 1673. We believe that the western half of the Hancock-Mitchell house was constructed in this same period, most probably by the 1670s when the first up-Island settlement at (West) Tisbury was established, and this older portion, as we have suggested, was very likely the homestead of John Mayhew, grandson of Governor Thomas Mayhew. It is probable that the carved boat drawing is also from this period.

Though the drawing is rudimentary, there is enough here to suggest that the vessel is an unusual one to our eyes, evidently a very early type of single-masted sloop. It has a high stern, a long waist, a severely inclined, or raked, mast, and a high bowsprit, much more vertically inclined than we are accustomed to seeing. Vessels illustrated in Chapelle’s History of American Sailing Ships indicate that raked masts and high bowsprits were already a thing of the past in coastal vessels in this area by mid-18th century.\footnote{Howard I. Chapelle, The History of American Sailing Ships, Bonanza Books, N.Y., 1935, pp. 12-18.}

A much earlier vessel reconstructed by Chapelle from a drawing in 1720 by Burgis, entitled “Sloop off Boston Light,” is very close to what we see in the drawing found in the Hancock-Mitchell house.\footnote{Chapelle, p.18.} It too, has a high stern,
a long waist, steeply raked mast, and a high bowsprit. The vertical lines in the stern of our drawing may indicate gunports as shown on the Boston sloop. Chapelle says that these raked-mast, high-topsail sloops could be seen off New England shores, possibly as early as the late years of the 17th century. Could this have been the type of vessel that carried the Mayhews to New York and Judge Sewall to Rode-Island? A slightly later, but more complete, drawing found by Tony Higgins on another old Island house seems to confirm that this was a common early boat type.

"[He] died by drowning 1711-1714 between the Vineyard and Nantucket, according to tradition." These terse words in the Banks genealogy describe the fatal involvement with the sea that ended the life of one early Vineyarder, Robert Luce.

Farming and seafaring, a settled and an adventurous life, seemed to go hand-in-hand in the lives of many early Islanders, and a epitaph such as this was not uncommon.

Bermuda sloop as carved on a board at Robert Luce house, "Red Farm." a little mast at the stern of the vessel, are almost an exact replica of Burgis's sloop of 1720, as reproduced in Chapelle. It is an interesting companion piece to the slightly earlier Hancock-Mitchell drawing. One has to wonder if it might have been a sloop like this one, pictured on a board in his own house, that carried Robert Luce to a watery grave off Nantucket.

As would have been common during this period, the sloop appears to be British, complete with the Union Jack flying from the stern. However, a drawing that Tony found adjacent to the first appears to be a distinctly American type. The profile of the hull and to some degree the rig look very similar to an early type of fast sloop first developed in the West Indies for "profitable but illegal trades." By the end of the 17th century, similar vessels were being built in Bermuda, and the hull type became known as the "Bermuda sloop," in Chapelle's words:

This was a keel sloop of some size, up to 65 feet in length, having a straight rising floor, well rounded bilge, and rather upright topside giving it a rather "heart shaped" midsection.

in extreme cases... The freeboard to the main deck was low... the stem was usually well rounded in profile and the hull drew much more water aft than forward.

Fast sloops of this type were adopted by builders in Chesapeake Bay and later in New England where they came to be known as Marblehead sloops. The earliest plan of an American vessel that has yet been found, according to Chapelle, "is of a sloop of this class, the Mediator, purchased for the Royal Navy in 1745 and built in 'Virginia' about 1741. This sloop was bought in the West Indies and sailed to England where she was measured and drawings made, shortly before she was lost at Dunkirk."

Chapelle's drawing of the Mediator, with guns, and a high topsail rig, appears in profile to be a somewhat larger version of the same basic type of sloop as is pictured in the second drawing from the Luce house.

Both these large sloops appear to have been built in the first half of the 18th century. Can the Red Farm building be this old? Confirmation that this is so came during renovations of the house that took place in 1973. When Tony Higgins was removing the siding from the front wall of the house, he discovered between the two front windwos framing for a single, leaded-pane, casement window. These

\[9\] Chapelle, Watercraft, p.16.

\[10\] Chapelle, Watercraft, pp.16-17.

\[11\] Chapelle, Watercraft, p.17.
small casement windows are a sure indication that this was a very early Vineyard homestead. Single, small windows like this on either side of the front door must have been customary on Island houses built before the 1720s, when window glass still had to be imported from Europe, the cost dictating smaller and fewer windows. Anne Baker found evidence of similar windows in the Vincent house of 1672. This, and other features of its construction, leads us to believe that Red Farm is of probably late 17th, early 18th century vintage, which accords exactly with Chapelle's dating for these large, raked-masted, topsail sloops.

On a wide board of the upstairs stairway of the old Belden house in Chilmark is a carved drawing of a somewhat later sloop or cutter. The house was built about 1760 by William Tilton and this drawing is very similar to topsail sloops and cutters illustrated in Chapelle with this date. Gone is the raked mast; the bowsprit extends more horizontally; and there is a much greater spread of canvas aloft, indicating a vessel of some speed.

A somewhat stiffer drawing from the wall of the large back room (the old kitchen) of the Hancock-Mitchell house shows a similar sloop probably dating from the mid-18th century. These large 18th century sloops pictured on Vineyard walls must have been cumbersome and hard to handle. Chapelle comments that large sloops of this kind "created a problem of manning, particularly when owned in a small village, for the rig in such large hulls required big crews. Hence, it was not long before the more easily managed schooner rig was applied to the type." Though schooners were a common sight in Vineyard waters a century later, it is interesting that none of these earliest pictures shows a two-masted vessel.

When we removed the layers of old wallpaper from the little northwest bedroom of the Hancock-Mitchell house, we found innumerable thinly engraved drawings of principally square-rigged vessels, covering the exposed vertical boards of the walls. It was as if some young boy with a talent for drawing and a love of the sea had sketched vessels that he had seen sailing in Island waters. According to Henry Scott's genealogies of families who lived in the house, a Samuel Hancock (son of Russell Hancock who may have moved the house to Quansoo and rebuilt it) was born in this house in 1772 and grew up to become a master mariner; could he have been the young artist? One of the clearest drawings shows a two-masted square sailed brig complete with high sails and rigging. Just after

13 Chapelle, Watercraft, p.17.
the Revolutionary War, when Samuel would have been a young boy, two-masted brigs began to be used by whalemens from this Island and Nantucket. Crevecoeur in his descriptions of Martha's Vineyard published in 1782 wrote:

The vessels most proper for whale fishing are brigs of about 150 tons burthen, particularly when they are intended to distant latitudes; they always man them with thirteen hands, in order that they may row two whale boats; the crews of which must necessarily consist of six, four at the oars, one standing on the bows with the harpoon, and the other at the helm. It is also necessary that there be two of these boats, that if one should be destroyed in attacking the whale, the other, which is never engaged at the same time, may be ready to save the hands. Five of the thirteen are always Indians; the last of the complements remains on board to steer the vessel during the action.  

This drawing is not so clear or complete as the earlier ones from the Luce house and it is hard to know how literally to take the deep body of the vessel or the five tiers of square sails. An early brig of the type Crevecoeur described is illustrated by Henry Rusk in Chapelle. This shows a smaller vessel than the one crudely engraved on the board. It has a trimmer hull and a simpler rig — one that would be easier to handle with a small crew, half of whom might be out chasing a whale. Growing up on the Vineyard, Samuel would certainly have known whaling brigs of this type and his drawing looks like the sort of thing a young boy, infatuated with ships and the sea, might have drawn.

Though this seems to be a logical scenario, so far as we can tell, Samuel did not go to sea on whaling adventures; instead, he became a merchant seaman, ultimately to become a Master Mariner in the trans-Atlantic trade. He lived in turbulent times and his letters, published in the Intelligencer, tell of being taken captive at sea, first by the French in 1798 and then by the British at the outbreak of the War of 1812; he wrote of being incarcerated and of finally returning to the Island where his English-born wife, lonely on remote Quansoo, was longing for her home across the sea.

In 1812, when taken prisoner by a British naval squadron,
Samuel was sailing the brig *Minerva*. This was probably a slow, deep-bottomed, high-rigged merchant vessel like the kettle-bottomed brigs developed by the famed Salem ship owner, John N. Cushing. In fact, if we take the drawing from the Hancock Mitchell house literally, with its deep hull and five tiers of square sails, it is closer to the merchant vessel than to the earlier whaling brigs.

However, we have to doubt whether a grown Samuel Hancock would have taken to doodling on the walls of his own house. Moreover, the tiny bedroom off the old kitchen where these drawings appear, would hardly have been an appropriate room for the master of the house. Could it be that these drawings were done, not by the elder Samuel, but by one of his sons thinking of his father while he was away at sea? We know that he had two sons, Samuel T. and Cyrus, who were left behind with their English mother, and they probably saw their father aboard his ship before he sailed away to an uncertain fate. Drawings can often be a way of expressing inner anxieties and fantasies; in this case, they may have been a young son's way of thinking about his absent father, whom he undoubtedly missed.

With these simple drawings, we can document a forgotten chapter in Vineyard nautical history. After the era of the whaling and merchant brigs, and the whaling barks that were to follow, smaller sloops and ketches, and larger schooners became the preferred coastal craft off these shores. By this time we are in a more familiar and better documented period, the end of which many old-timers still remember.

**Acknowledgements**

The author thanks Richard Burt for his assistance on historical facts. Thanks also to John Pison and Tony Higgins, whose careful observations disclosed the drawings described, the latter also has provided photographs of two of them. If any reader knows of similar boat drawings, please get in touch with the author or the editor of this journal.


---

**The First Week in the Woods**

*The First Chapter in the History of Martha's Vineyard Camp-Meeting*

by HENRY BAYLIES

The Society has in its archives a scrapbook kept by Henry Baylies (1822-1893), son of Frederick Baylies Jr., the architect of Edgartown. Henry, an 1846 graduate of Wesleyan College and a Methodist minister, married five times. None of his wives was a Vineyarder. In the scrapbook are a number of articles he wrote about the Martha’s Vineyard Campground. It was of special interest to him because he was present at its birth in the summer of 1835, as he writes here. His article is from Zion’s Herald, the official Methodist journal, dated August 25, 1872. Baylies’s scrapbook in which it is preserved was given to the Society by Joanne Coffin Clark, a distant relative.

The week before the first camp-meeting held on the present grounds of the Martha’s Vineyard Camp-meeting Association was long ago, but is fresh in my recollection. It had been decided to inaugurate a camp-meeting which should be held annually until the millennium, whenever that might occur. Jeremiah Pease Esq., of Edgartown, for long years the unpaid apostle to the “East side,” had traversed the East Chop, and selected the grove, and marked the two stately oaks which should become the chief pillars of this new temple of our Lord. These were to stand on either hand of the preachers’ stand, and upon them were to hang two large lanterns, to enlighten the preachers while they should enlighten the people.

A vessel was freighted at Edgartown with lumber, sails, etc., for the new camping-ground. Her cargo was rafted ashore on the east side of the Chop, just below the Bluffs bathing-houses. It was a hard day’s work to get the material

1 “East side” was Eastville, where Jeremiah was the unpaid Methodist lay preacher.
2 At the Oak Bluffs beach near Waban Park.
ashore, and up to the grove; but it was done, and the preachers' stand was partly constructed the same day.

The preachers' stand, as many will remember, was a mere shanty, made of rough boards, without shingles or floor; the inside designed for preachers' lodgings, and the outside for preachers' preaching. The first night came on before the stand, our only shelter in the woods, was completed. Wearied with the long and hard day's work, prayers said, we all turned in to enjoy the laboring man's sleep.

We were waked by noise, like rain on our roof; but the oldest of our party assured us it was "only the dew dripping from the trees." The "dew" came thicker and faster, and proved more copious than even the dew on Hermon. Our straw bed was in period of flood, and the "boys" turned out and shoveled more rough boards upon the roof, just in season to escape a thorough drenching.

The oldest of the "boys" says the youngest, who is the writer hereof, dreamed that night of snakes, and cried out in his sleep, "Take that snake off." The novelty of sleeping in the woods, and the wildness of the night, render his statement quite probable.

During the week, the stand was completed, seats were arranged, and some nine tent frames, built of rough joists, were covered with superannuated sails of various patterns. While the men were thus employed, we two younger boys, John Wesley and myself, were employed in pulling up huckleberry brush within the "circle of the tents," and doubtless thought we had the hardest part of the work.

Water was obtained by sinking two barrels close to the edge of the Squashmeadow Pond, now called "Lake Anthony," for some reason to the writer unknown. These barrels furnished sufficient water for the first meeting. Owing to a storm, and the non-arrival of a vessel which was to bring us supplies, we got short of provisions, and John W.

---

and myself were started out on a foraging expedition. We succeeded and, at noon-time, brought in from a farm house, near by, a large tin pail full of salt junk, potatoes, turnips, parsnips, etc., which were spread for our dinner. Our table was the door of the preachers' stand, laid on carpenter's saw benches. The dinner and the table were rough, but good appetites converted the salt junk, even, into a luxury.

Our party, camping on the ground this first week, were Thomas M. Coffin Esq., and his two sons, Sirson P. and John Wesley, and Frederick Baylies Esq., and his son Henry, the writer hereof, all of Edgartown. I think Mr. Freeman Sherman of Nantucket was with Jeremiah Pease Esq., when the place was selected. 5

Messrs. Thomas M. Coffin, Jeremiah Pease, and Frederick Baylies took the first lease of the ground for a camp-meeting, of William Butler Esq., and agreed to pay fifteen dollars for it, and to pay all damage that might be done to the woods and fences, and to the sheep by dogs.

This was the day of small beginnings, and small prices. The speculation in camp-meeting lots had not then begun,

---

3 Right from the start, it seems, tents were framed with lumber, not true tents at all.
4 Now Oak Bluffs harbor, Lake Anthony was named for the New Bedford Standard's editor who lived on Lake Avenue and publicized the resort.
5 Jeremiah Pease's diary shows that Freeman Sherman had visited him during the spring of that year. Jeremiah was not present during this week of construction.
it would seem. Frederick Baylies, one of the original projectors of this meeting, alone survives. Of the original five who camped on the ground that first week, T.M. Coffin Esq., only has passed upwards, Sirson P. Coffin Esq., has long been familiarly known as the Agent of the Association, and has camped on the ground almost ever since. His brother, John Wesley Coffin, resides in Watertown, and the writer hereof in Boston.

My pen moves on to write of the progress of the meeting since that first week, but others have written of this. Perhaps what I have already written, may as well not be written; but here it is for what it is worth, and it supplies the first chapter in the history of this now famous Vineyard Camp-meeting, which has never before, to my knowledge, been written.

Elsewhere in his scrapbook, Henry Baylies pasted other news items about the camp meetings, items that he wrote for several newspapers on the mainland. They provide some interesting information about Wesleyan Grove's beginnings.

The business of running the campground was not conducted on the Vineyard. The Martha's Vineyard Camp Meeting Committee consisted of off-Island men and meetings were held in New Bedford. On March 12, 1857, after one of its meetings, Baylies reported:

A Mr. Dykes of Wareham has purchased the [camp] ground... as he stated to secure it to the Methodists, and, as he further stated, significantly, with an eye to his own interest. A committee was appointed to confer with Mr. D. and that Committee reported that he paid about $1000 for the ground and would sell it to the Committee for $1600, or would lease to them for $100 per year; whereupon it was voted neither to buy nor lease on any such terms.

A committee was raised to instructions to consider the selection of suitable grounds for future Camp Meetings, on the Vineyard or elsewhere, to report at the next Camp Meeting.

The present lease secures the ground for meetings four years longer. If Mr. D. is a Methodist and his heirs are Methodists, I think he has sufficiently "secured the grounds for the use of the Methodists." He and his family will be privileged to improve it forever undisturbed.

A committee was raised to arrange for the conveyance of baggage from the shore to the Camp Ground and return, so that the system of extortion heretofore practiced may be terminated...  

After the 1857 camp meeting, Reverend Baylies wrote in the North Bridgewater Gazette:

The Camp Meeting... is, not only a great religious institution, but social and sanitary. It is become a part of the social system of Methodism, for Methodism, as a system, is eminently social. I know of no place where a week can be spent to more advantage to the physical, social, and especially to the spiritual man, than on this spot. The encampment has increased from a small circle of nine tents to a city of near three hundred tents. Most of these tents are family homes, fitted up according to the ability or taste of the occupants, to be demolished at the expiration of the week... It is one of the most charming spots in the world.

Two years later, describing the 1859 camp meeting, Baylies seems to have become disenchanted with the trend toward more "social" camp meetings:

It is feared the encampment is becoming too much of the picnic-style... Stereoscopic views are now available.

But five years later, in his newspaper account of the 1864 camp meeting, Baylies has accepted the socializing.

For several years... large numbers have become accustomed to spend a week or two at the Grove before the meeting begins. Families find this a pleasant spot to spend a few weeks in the enjoyment of Pic-Nic life... Many fine houses have been erected the present season. Owing to the high price

---

6 Hebron Vincent disputed this point. He was still alive and he claimed to have been one of the "original projectors." See Intelligencer, May 1885.

7 See Hebron Vincent, Wesleyan Grove Camp Meeting, Lee and Shepard, Boston, 1870, v.ii, p.28 and p.138. When the committee refused Mr. Dyke's offer, he apparently sold it back to the previous owner, Butler. In 1865, the land was purchased for $1,100 with funds raised from tent and cottage owners.

8 Taking advantage of tourists is obviously not a modern invention.
of canvas, wooden houses are taking the place of the more camp-like tents. The grounds are exceedingly pleasant. Great improvements have been made in tent and cottage architecture, but I fear there is far too much extravagance in this direction.

Denomination partition walls seem to be broken down or not to have existed on the grounds. All denominations, except the Roman Catholics, mingle in the social and religious exercises of this place. This is a charming feature of this great social and religious gathering...

The boat bell has already rung for 10 o'clock, and the voice of the presiding Elder has called all well-disposed persons either to retire to their beds or from the ground. Being well-disposed myself, I will retire within the sheets...

That was the last article Reverend Baylies wrote about the campground until his 1872 memoir describing its beginnings, printed above. He stopped attending that year, 1864. His fourth wife, Lydia (Brownell), divorced him, something frowned upon by Methodists. The Bishop immediately transferred him to Davenport, Iowa, "for health reasons." There he served as pastor for two years before giving up the ministry (again for "health reasons") to spend several years as teacher and administrator in Methodist colleges in the area. He returned to Massachusetts in 1869, was admitted to the state bar in 1870 and practiced law in Boston for many years. He died at his home in Malden in 1893.

---

The English and the Indians
On Martha's Vineyard
Part IV: Matthew, John and Experience

by ARTHUR R. RAILTON

He never preached to them, but Matthew Mayhew probably had more influence on the Indians than any other Mayhew. While the missionary Mayhews prepared the "savages" for the next world, Matthew took care of this one.

He was the oldest of the three sons of missionary Thomas Mayhew Jr., being 11 when his father was lost at sea in 1657. His brother Thomas was 7 and John was 5.1 Thomas Mayhew Sr., asked Thomas Junior's employer, the English Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, to pay for the education of the three fatherless boys. The Society, known as the New England Company, agreed to educate only Matthew, enrolling him in Corlett's preparatory school at Cambridge, the best in the colony. The Company expected him to go on to Harvard and become a missionary.

That wasn't to be. Matthew was not cut out to be a missionary. He was unable (or refused) to learn the Indian language, something the Company required. Despite this, for six years it paid for his schooling. During those years, Matthew learned much. His schoolmates were sons of important men in the colony. Living with them, he developed the self-confidence that served him throughout life. Most of them went on to Harvard. Matthew never did. After all, they didn't have to learn Algonquin; their parents, not the Company, were paying the bill.2

1 There were also two daughters, Jerusha and Jedidah, both younger than the boys.
2 In 1694, Matthew wrote knowledgeably about Indian dialects. Perhaps he learned the language later; he did not at Cambridge.

ARTHUR R. RAILTON is the editor of this journal.
In 1664, the New England Company ended its support of Matthew, then 17. He returned to the Vineyard and soon was deputy to his elderly grandfather. It was a position for which he was well suited. About 1672, he married his sister-in-law, Mary Skiff, connecting the Skiffes and the Mayhews doubly. Mary's sister Sarah was married to his brother Thomas.

Grandfather Mayhew lived a long life, affording grandson Matthew a thorough training. When the old man died in 1682 at 90, Matthew took over. He was in his mid-30s, a confident and well-educated leader. His two younger brothers were also in important positions, spiritual and temporal, expanding the family's tight control over the English and Indians.

Whether by intent or by happenstance, the brothers each served a different village: Matthew in Edgartown; Thomas in Chilmark; and John in Tisbury. All were on the payroll of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel: John, the youngest, as missionary; Matthew and Thomas as "rulers" of the Indians.

Matthew was the best educated, the only one to have gone off-Island to school. He was, in the words of historian Charles E. Banks, "probably the most cultivated person, intellectually speaking, on the Island in his time." Unlike his missionary father, he was indifferent to religion. His brother-in-law, Benjamin Smith, said, "... [for him] ther was no such thing as fall of man, for man is naturally Inclined to vice: And that Religion is so Redicolas a thing that seven thousand of the wisest Gentlemen in London had declared themselves to be athe[i]sts."

His style of rule was "not only as vigorous but equally as tactless," as that of his grandfather, the Governor. For governing the Indians, he was paid £20 a year by the London company until about 1700. He claimed that, like his grandfather, he satisfied the Indians "by reason more than authoritie," but that was not true. In one action, he and the Governor of New York took possession of Gay Head without even telling the Indians, its owners. The two men made it a separate geographical entity, a Manor, which set the stage for it to become, years later, a "reservation." Such was not their intent. They intended for it to become a huge manorial estate in the English tradition.

Brother Thomas, like Matthew, showed no interest in mission work. He preferred government. He was named a justice of the court and, in 1699, Chief Justice. He was "long impowered in the government of the Indians," nephew Experience Mayhew wrote. For this, he was paid £10 a year by the London company until his death in 1715. His marriage to Sarah Skiff produced six children, one of whom, Zaccheus, took over as "ruler" of the Indians when his father died.

With his older brothers in government, spiritual concerns fell upon John. In 1673, at age 20, he became the first pastor of the English church in (West) Tisbury. His tombstone reads: "... worthy laborious Minister of ye Gospell to ye inhabitants of Tisbury & Chilmark united & to ye Christian Indians." Like his missionary father, he had no training for the ministry and was never ordained as minister. In 1678, he began preaching to the Indians in their language, having learned it as a youth, and was soon put on the Company payroll.

---

3 He also took over his grandfather's place on the Company payroll.

4 Both Thomas and John lived at Quanoo, in Chilmark but on the Tisbury line, which was not precise at the time.

5 Benjamin married Jedidiah Mayhew. His father was the controversial Rev. John Smith of Barnstable. His mother was the sister of Gov. Thomas Hindley of Plymouth, Experience Mayhew's father-in-law. See Charles E. Banks, History of Martha's Vineyard, DCHS, 1966, v.11, Annals of Edg., p.83.


7 Marrying a Mayhew was rewarding for the Skiffes. Sarah's brother, Benjamin Skiff, held several appointed positions in Chilmark and Tisbury. Nathan, another brother, was Tisbury Town Clerk. But James, the oldest Skiff, joined the Athearn rebellion and was "encouraged" to move to Nantucket.

8 The tombstone is our only contemporaneous record of John having been minister of the (West) Tisbury church. The first "settled" minister shown in the Tisbury Town Records is Rev. Josiah Torrey in 1679. Rev. Thomas Prince, writing nearly 40 years later, stated that John preached to the English at Tisbury for 15 years, but the Town Records don't show that.
The Indian population had steadily decreased. By 1680, there were only 1000, more than half living up-Island. John had little involvement with the Indians to the east. He was sermon adviser to Janawannit, the Indian minister at Christiantown,\(^9\) north of (West) Tisbury, according to his son, Experience:

Jana\(wa\)n\(ni\)t ... [was] a very diligent Reader of the holy Scriptures. ... One day, when I was a Youth, heard him preach and pray ... he would not ordinarily preach a Sermon till he had sought and obtained some Assistance ... for this Purpose he generally waited on my Father once a Week.\(^{10}\)

As a young missionary (he was 21), John started at only £5 a year, but by 1686 he was being paid £30. Some have written that he was also paid £15 a year by Tisbury as its minister, but that is not in the town records.

His career ended at age 37. William Homes, an Irishman teaching school in Tisbury, wrote in his diary:

Mr. John Mayhew of Chilmark Died Feb:3d 1688/89 about two of the Clock in the morning and was buryed Feb. 4th.
His distemper was a pain in his Stomacke, Shortness of breath and a faintness, his Distemper continued from the last of September till the time above said.\(^{11}\)

John’s death left the Vineyard without a missionary. There were numerous Indian ministers on the London payroll, but for the first time in 40 years there was no Mayhew missionary. Matthew Mayhew, the de facto Governor, seemed unconcerned. He had greater worries. Critical events were taking place on the mainland. Massachusetts citizens, angered by Catholic King James’ treatment of the Puritans, were close to revolt.

Matthew was comfortable with the rule of King James and had no close ties to Massachusetts. The Vineyard was under the authority, mild though it was, of New York, formerly the proprietorship of the Duke of York, who was now King James. Matthew had first met the Duke’s agents in 1670, at age 22, when he went to New York to defend his family’s claim to the islands. In 1671, he returned with his grandfather, who no doubt leaned heavily on him. That trip was a triumph. The Governor of New York appointed Thomas Mayhew “Governor for Life of the English and Indians of Martin’s Vineyard” and set up the Manor of Tisbury with Governor Thomas and Matthew as Lords of the Manor. Matthew’s relationship with New York being what it was, he could have had no wish to revolt against the King.

Before his death in 1682, Governor Mayhew gave large sections of up-Island land to his grandchildren, land he had bought from sachem Pamhannet and others in 1664. One piece, Quansoo, went to John in 1681. John already owned land on the adjacent Quanaimes, where he lived.\(^{12}\) In 1681, the governor sold “in consideration of a valuable sum,” a piece of meadow next to John’s land to Daniel Steward, a Scot who had just moved to Tisbury from the Cape. There were several more property exchanges along the shore south of (West) Tisbury, an area much used by the Indians.

The purchases of Indian land wasn’t limited to individuals. In 1678, the inhabitants of Tisbury voted “that John eddy and Josiph dagit shall have pourer to by what land Thay canne of the indians for the use of The toune.” In 1681, James Allen and John Eddy, both of Tisbury, bought “for the use and benefit of the English town” from John Papamick, an Indian of Takanmy, “a certain neck of land... commonly called Mussoowoukahouk” for “a valuable sum.”

These encroachments, along with others, worried sachem Mattack, Gay Head’s first Christian Indian. He decided they must be stopped. On September 11, 1681, he declared:

I, Mattack, Sachem at Kuhruhquehtuut [Gay Head] and Nashaquaset [Nashaquoite] as far as Wanummusit [I].
Know ye all People that I, Mattack and my principal men,

9. This was the third Indian church on the island, the others were in Edgartown.
11. Homes, who was living there at the time, doesn’t say John Mayhew was minister of the (West) Tisbury church.
12. In his will, Governor Mayhew wrote: “I give unto my daughter Hannah... all that land or neck called Quannans or Quanoowawezen...” The will was dated June 16, 1681. Quansoo and Quanaimes are adjacent necks on Black Point Pond.
my children and people, are owners of this — this, our land forever. . . no person shall sell any land . . . if my sons . . . sell, they shall fall forever. . . I Mattack, sachem, and my chief men speak this in the presence of God. It shall be thus forever.

The declaration was witnessed by four Indians, his “principal men.” A copy was filed as a “true copy” by Matthew Mayhew, Clerk. Another Indian, Sananapinu, added “that this writing was made by Mattack; witness my hand. This writing is indeed true.”

Mattack’s concern was valid. The Indians’ traditional notion of communal land was being Puritanized. It was an inevitable result of the mission work, of making the “savages” more English in religion and customs:

. . . land sales were occasionally made between the natives themselves and even from white to natives . . . Thomas Mayhew [Matthew’s brother] purchased a seventeen-acre tract from an Indian, which he resold to another Indian in 1666. . . Two Tisbury Indians . . . Rachael and Israel Amos, a widow and her son, sold a tract of Gay Head land to the Indian proprietors for twenty pounds.

Mattack didn’t live to see his beloved Gay Head sold. He died in 1684, succeeded as sachem by his son Joseph Mataack. But it wasn’t long before Gay Head, the land Mattack had declared to be “our land forever,” was sold.

In 1683, the year after Governor Mayhew died, Thomas Dongan, an Irish Catholic, was named Governor of New York by King James. He called for an assembly of delegates from New York, Maine, Nantucket and Martha’s Vineyard, the colony’s first representative assembly. Matthew probably attended as the Vineyard delegate. The following year, Dongan appointed him Chief Justice of Dukes County and Richard Sarson, Thomas Daggett and Thomas Mayhew were named Associate Justices. No Governor was named, that title having died with the senior Thomas. Justices

Sarson and Daggett had married Mayhew women; the government continued to be a family affair.

Governor Dongan may have asked Matthew about buying land on the Vineyard. Gay Head was the only large area without English ownership. Within two years, Matthew and Dongan put together one of the largest land grabs in Vineyard history. On April 25, 1685, the Governor created the “Manor and Lordship of Martin’s Vineyard” and named Matthew the Lord of the Manor. Included was the “Island called Martin’s Vineyard together with . . . Islands called Nomans Land and Elizabeth Islands. . .”

Matthew was now twice a Lord. He was already Lord of the Manor of Tisbury, appointed in 1671 by Governor Lovelace. Now, he was Lord of “Martin’s” Vineyard and the adjacent islands. Edgartown being already a Mayhew preserve, his word was now law across the entire island. All pretense of democracy was gone. Who needed the title of Governor? Being twice-Lord was better.

But Matthew’s second Lordship was short-lived. In a puzzling development, three weeks later he and Governor Dongan signed a second agreement. In it, Matthew and his wife, Mary, sold to Dongan for £200, the same Manor of Martin’s Vineyard the two men had put together 17 days before. Excepted was any land previously given to Matthew by his father or grandfather.

Dongan was eager to see what he had bought. On December 10, 1685, Wait Winthrop wrote to his brother, Fitz-John:

. . . I hear the Govr. of York intends to visit Martha’s Vineyard this winter. I wish I could learn the certainty of it. It might be of concernment to me to be there.

Winthrop had reason to talk to Governor Dongan. On October 17, 1682, three years earlier, he had purchased

---

13 There are various spellings of the sachem’s name. Except when in direct quotations with a different spelling, we will use Mattack for the father and Mataack for the son.
15 On most documents created in New York, the Vineyard was called Martin’s Vineyard.
16 Matthew was Dongan’s agent after the purchase of Gay Head, thus controlling its use.
17 Amelia Forbes Estes, Early History of Naushon Island, privately printed, 1935, p.158. There is no record that Dongan came to the island. Wait-Still Winthrop was the son of Thomas Mayhew’s early business partner, John Winthrop Jr.
Naushon, the largest of the Elizabeth Islands, from Matthew Mayhew for £440. Now he has learned Matthew sold it to Dongan, along with much more.

Matthew's sale of Naushon was suspect on another count. He and his Aunt Hannah had inherited only three-quarters of the island from Governor Mayhew, who had sold the other quarter to Peter Oliver of Boston for £30 in 1666. In a letter to Winthrop, Matthew indicated some concern:

I suppose you understand that although I sell you the whole Island for 440 lbs. yet if Mr Line should recover the quarter, I shall be bound only to return 40 lbs. As to Mr. Haines, with all Dammages: I speak not thirfore that I think he can ever recover it, but lest peradventure, if your Boston Government should (though unlikely) it have annexed to their Jurisdiction, I know not what blinde illegal notions may come into their more than Monarchichall crowns; I can now have the same mony for only three quarters...18

Matthew's admission of a clouded title did not please Winthrop, who noted on the bottom of the letter:

The above said supposal about the forty pounds is Mr Mayhew's own conceite for I made no such condition with him but he is to secure the title of the whole to me in all respects.19

But Dongan seemed not interested in Naushon. It was Gay Head that appealed to his manorial tastes. Even there, however, the boundary lines were unclear. The deed gave Dongan “all that Island and tract of land called the Island of Martin’s Vineyard” with certain exceptions, which included Nashowakemmuck (Chilmark), Quanaimes, half of Kiphiggon (Cape Higgon), Nashaquitsa and parts of Edgartown. Gay Head wasn’t even mentioned, but what was left after eliminating the Manor of Tisbury and the other properties belonging to Matthew.

The Indians, who Mattack had declared to be owners

18 Mr. Haines held a mortgage of £500 on three-quarters of Naushon that Governor Mayhew had taken out the year he died. Mr. Line may have been lawyer for Peter Oliver, who owned the other quarter. Matthew suggested Winthrop pay Aunt Hannah £10 for her share, but he refused. Although Matthew seemed opposed to “Monarchichall crowns,” his rule was not democratic.

19 Emerson, p.102.

forever of Gay Head and Nashaquitsa, had not been consulted about the sale of their land.20

Two years later Matthew seems to have realized his mistake. In 1687, he took Joseph Matack, son of the dead sachem Mattack, to New York. There, Governor Dongan paid the Indian £30 for Gay Head, land he had supposedly bought from Matthew earlier. It was strange, confusing and perhaps illegal. But who cared? Governor Dongan's sponsor, the former Duke of York had now become King James II of England. Who dared to take a friend of the King of England to court?

But King James was soon dethroned, replaced by William and Mary in 1689. The Vineyard was made part of Massachusetts, the cradle of democracy. Perhaps that gave the Gay Head Indians the confidence to take their case to court. They wanted their land back, land they were now paying rent to live on.21 They asked the court to declare the Dongan purchase illegal.

Matthew Mayhew wrote to Winthrop on September 25, 1700, about the claim:

Our Indians are in good peace and quiet, and as usually rest satisfied in expectation of common Justice... The Indians expect something will be don and wee hope will...it hath been a rule, in and since my grandfather's time in all things to satisfy them by reason more than authority. And I pray god it may be well continued as it was well and successfully begun.

I understand by Mr Stoughton, that the Indian concerns would be considered in October. I hope I shall not be forgotten, my head as well as tongue, and paines is always employed, I beleive more than you are sensible of. This

20 This was not an isolated case. The English were often indifferent to Indian ownership. Benjamin Skiffe (1718) bequeathed to his niece “Sarah...a certain tract of land near the Stone Wall pond, being partly purchased of the Indians & part not purchased... I give her the whole tract.” Banks, Annals of Chilmark, v.ii, pp.38-9. Nashaquitsa was different, it had been sold by Mittersick's son, Joseph, to John Mayhew in 1654.

21 In 1714, Samuel Sewall wrote in his diary: “Jonas Acoos, saith that he took up with Ocor. Dongan's Terms, brought a Red-bar of Indian Corn to Mr. Thomas Mayhew to signify it. Terms were to pay a Peck of Wheat yearly for a while, and then to pay a Bushel of Wheat per annum, which Conditions he has not perform'd.” Massachusetts Historical Society Collections (MHS Colls.), Sewall Diary, vol. vi, 5th seq., p.434.
crooked age being wholly to subvert them, but I shall not presume to enlarge. —  

The process took longer than Stoughton expected. Three years later, in 1703, the court appointed a special Committee in Barnstable to rule on the case. There were, of course, no Indians on the Committee, nor any Vineyarders. The Indians claimed Gay Head was theirs forever, based on Mattack's declaration. No person, Indian or Englishman, had a right to sell it. Not even the sachem's son. The sale to Dongan by Joseph Matack was illegal. They wanted their land back.

The Committee met in Barnstable, August 18, 1703, and ruled against them, declaring the Mattack document a forgery:

In the contest about Gay Head, it appears to us by deed that Colonel Dongan bought it of Joseph Matack, sachem, but the Indians object and say that old Matack by his will did settle it on his sons for the use of Gay Head Indians, never to be sold or alienated from them; and to prove it produce an old writing, and upon inquiring into the truth of it, an Indian called Jonah Hosewit, which seemed to be a sober, honest man, came before the Committee and owned that he wrote that writing long since Matack's death, and by the testimony of sundry other Indians, we have good reason to think that said writing was forged, and not true.

There was no mention of Matthew Mayhew, Clerk, having certified its authenticity. No mention of the other Indian's statement. The ruling rested on one man's confession of forgery. It would seem that Jonah Hosewit, confessed forger, could not have been very popular when he returned to Gay Head, now owned by Dongan.

The Indians' suit also involved Nashaquitsa, the land between Quitsa and Squibnocket Ponds. It was included in Mattack's declaration and therefore was forever theirs. However, Nashawauquidsee, as the Indians called it, had been

bought by John Mayhew, the Tisbury missionary, from Joseph Matack in 1684, shortly after old Mattack died and three years before Dongan bought Gay Head. Again, the committee ruled against the Indians. This time the evidence was a fence:

...it appears that there hath for some years since been a fence maintained between this Neck and Gay Head, one half by the Indians and the other half by the owners of said Neck, which gives us reason to think that the Indians for many years past did suppose it to be honestly conveyed from them to said John Mayhew.

In 1705, the Indians tried once more. This time they included Nomans Land as well as Gay Head. Indian Moses Will represented Gay Head, Sam Assewit represented Nomans Land. The court ordered,

...the Sheriff of the County notify Matthew Mayhew, Esq., Agent for the Earl of Limerick [former Governor Dongan], thereof, and such others as the said Indians shall name to him, and summon them then to attend to defend their claims, if any they have; And that the said Indians and their companions dwelling on the said lands be until then in peace and not molested or disturbed in their improvements.

And that in the meantime the will of Josia Matack [Mattack], Indian Sachem, with the proofs thereof, may be laid before the Governor and Council. . .

Like the earlier rulings, this one went against the Indians. The Earl of Limerick, the court ruled, was legal owner of the western end of the Island. Gay Head had been taken away from the native Americans.

Dongan never did visit Gay Head. What was behind his circuitous purchase? First, he had declared it a Manor, giving it to Lord Matthew Mayhew. Then, three weeks later, he bought it from Matthew for 200 pounds. This surely was to circumvent some Royal statute.

---
22 Emerson, p.105. Stoughton was Chief Justice of the Superior Court. Matthew's final paragraph is puzzling. The antecedent of "them" is unclear. We wish he had "inlarged."
23 Any unpopularity was short-lived. He soon became the Baptist minister at Gay Head.
24 Indians, sometimes, were consulted about land boundaries. In 1701, the Town of Tisbury appointed Simon Ashburn and others to "go and procure three indifferent Indians, of good report, to join with them to settle and run the line between Nashawauquidsee [Chilmark] and Tisbury." Tit. Town Rec., p.41. Of course, no private land ownership was at stake.
Why did he want it enough to break the law? Perhaps because his position had become insecure. Catholic King James was in trouble in England and the colonies. Being Irish Catholic, Dongan may have thought the New World offered a safer choice. His job was in jeopardy. King James was planning a New England Dominion, which would combine the colonies north of the Delaware River under one government. He, rumor had it, was not the King's choice for the Dominion governor. A large estate on isolated Gay Head could have been appealing place to spend his remaining years, hunting in the Irish tradition.

In 1687, Dongan asked King James about his future. If removed from office, he told the King, he would need £3500 to liquidate debts he had been "forced to contract." The following year, the king asked him to resign. Some thought he would be named Governor of Barbados, but he was not.  

The Protestants in the colony, angered by the King, were close to revolution. An Indian uprising, believed inspired by the French Catholics in Canada and New York, was predicted. It was said that Dongan supported it. There was a report that the Vineyard Indians were armed and ready to fight the English. In Rochester, N.Y., on September 16, 1688, an affidavit was taken:

Samuel Eldred, junior. . . did declare upon Oath, that on the Evening before, an Indian whom he had seized, by the name of Joseph, did in an insulting and vaunting manner, say, there was 500 [Indians] at Martin's Vineyard, 700 at Nantucket, and 400 at Chappaquasset [Chappaquiddick?], all very well armed . . . and that our Governour [Dongan] did not dare to disarm them for that the Governour had more love for them, the said Indians, than for His Majesties Subjects, the English.

Was Dongan, fearing his fate in a revolt, planning a safe haven at Gay Head, protected by armed Indians for whom, the affidavit said, he had more love than for the English?

Whatever his plan, he never made it to the Vineyard. After resigning, he spent the next three years on Long Island.  

The Manor would have been a safe haven. The Vineyard was quiet during the Glorious Revolution, as the overthrow of King James was called. While the Island had no revolt, glorious or otherwise, there were those who would have liked one. The dissidents, led by Simon Atchearn, saw the end of King James as a setback for Matthew Mayhew. The Protestant William and Mary, now on the throne, sent Henry Slaughter to New York to replace Dongan and ended the Dominion of New England. Atchearn wrote to the new Governor, citing the abuses the Vineyard people were suffering:

May it please your Excelency
To lend an ear, Considering . . . the good & wel being of the English Inhabitants of martains vineyard . . . we pray your aid, to settell the maintainens of the work of the ministrie on martains vineyard . . . Cons much disorder, both of Contention among the people, and the ministrie often Left vacant . . . there is much rong dun for sumtims the old law book of yorke is made use ofe to raise mony on our Cattell, at three times the valu . . . only tillage have they rated [taxed], all other lands and meadows have beene rate free . . . being about fifty-eight English Inhabitant families on the Iland & most pore, four of the wich Justices of the peace, . . . (all of one family, what and how thay please to raise monys on the people, without an assembly, the justices Estats being rate free) . . . and wee hope to be delivered from such arbitary power . . . and to be defended in all our town rights . . . against Ccoronal [Colonel] dongans purchas . . . And that the whole trade of disposing any strong Liquers to the Indians of the vineyard be stopt, which is a thin of so evil Consequnce in drunckenesse Eydnhesse & selling their corn for nought, which brings them into poverty and stealing for hunger: The Indians . . . would be servisable in the defenc of the Iland against the Enemy . . . if your Excelency would be pleased to bestow an hundred

25 Dongan had reason to avoid Ireland until 1691. That year the Catholic-Protestant war ended with the seige of Limerick by William of Orange.
27 For an exception to the quiet see Intelligencer, Nov. 1991, "A Puzzling Piracy off Tarpaunlin Cove."
arms with ammunition for the use of the Indians . . . in time of danger . . . Simon Athearn, 6 June 1691.28

Simon was wasting precious paper writing to New York. In the new royal charter of 1692, William and Mary made Martha's Vineyard and Nantucket part of Massachusetts, a change Athearn had long sought. However, the charter replaced most elected officials with royal appointees, a move away from the democracy Athearn was seeking. Matthew Mayhew, as expected, refused to accept the Vineyard's transfer to Massachusetts.30

Athearn's complaint about liquor sales to the Indians didn't mention names, so we don't know who was doing it. By coincidence, in the Society archives there is a letter from Matthew Mayhew to Samuel Shrimpton, a Boston merchant, written that same year.30

Sir: I wrote you lately requesting to credit me with a hoghead of Rumme about 60 gallons, & nails, clapboard & Single . . having a Conveniece to have it brought to Barnsbrre by the bearer Mr. Samuell Allin, request you would be pleased to send it by him. But if rumme is more than 2s 6p per Gallon would have but a barrel or thereabout . . .

This doesn't prove that Matthew was selling to the Indians, but sixty gallons is a lot of rum.

After the transfer of the Islands to Massachusetts, Wait Winthrop was delegated to give the Vineyard judges their oath of office. He wrote to Isaac Addington, secretary of Massachusetts, from Wood's Hole in October 1692.31

After I had been . . . at my Island [Naushon] some Time without opportunity of getting over to the Vineyard . . . I met Mr. Mayhew at this place, and . . . told him I had

29 The charter reads: "the isles of Cappawock and Nantucket near Cape Cod" are under Massachusetts. Matthew claimed that Cappawock was not Martha's Vineyard, but just a small island off Chappaquiddick. See Banks, v.I, chap.XVI. Also Margery R. Johnson, The Mayhew Mission to the Indians, PhD dissertation, Clark U., 1966, p.166f. The Johnson work is by far the best source available on Mayhew history.
30 Shrimpton was "a schemer . . . who unashamedly had operated a pirate supply base in Boston harbor . . ." G.B.Warden, Boston 1689-1776, Little Brown, Boston, 1970, p.9.
31 Matthew's intransigence was so well known in Boston that Sewall mentioned the Winthrop trip in his diary. N.H.S. Colls. v.V, 3rd ser., p.366.

his Excellency's order to administer the oaths to himself and the other officers which the Law required . . . but he utterly refused to accept of any place himself, but said he knew not but his brother [Thomas] and Mr. Newcomb32 might, which he should encourage; and so went home in his canoe and after some time returned me the enclosed papers, but . . . I resolved [not to] expose the Government as well as myself to contempt amongst such a crew as I understand are these . . . I hope his Excellency will . . . take effectual orders to settle that place, before they have farther orders from New York . . . 33

Winthrop's words, "such a crew as I understand are these," would seem to support Athearn's charges.

Despite the political changes in the colony, the Indian missions continued, carried on by the native preachers. Many of them seem to have moved into preaching after having been magistrates. In the Indian courts, disputes among native Americans were settled; any appeal went to the English court. When an Indian preacher died, a magistrate was often chosen to replace him in the higher paid position.

Indian magistrates were stricter than the English, according to Experience Mayhew's conversation with Indian Magistrate, William Lay:

. . . my Father [John Mayhew] once [told] him that he feared he was rather too severe in the Punishments he inflicted on his Countrymen, he readily reply'd, that when an English Man was whip'd, the Shame of it was commonly at least one half of the Punishment; but the Case being not so with the Indians, they ought to have the more in Smart [pain] for that they had no more Shame in them.

The missionary funds from London paid these "rulers," English as well as Indian. Some critics opposed this. One was Edward Randolph of Boston:

the money is bestowed upon some in the Magistracy, others in the Ministry, rather as pension then other publick good works . . . Christians becoming heathens, whilst endeavours

32 Andrew Newcomb had been proposed for the Vineyard court, "but the Mayhew influences were against him and he was not appointed." Banks, v.II, Annals of Ed., p.85.
33 Banks, v.I, p.186. Matthew and Thomas Mayhew finally took the oath in December 1692.
are pretended to convert the Infidels. 34

On the Vineyard, salaries went to Governor Mayhew, Matthew and Thomas Mayhew, plus various Indian sachems and magistrates, for helping to maintain order. Randolph said the funds should go to the Indian preachers:

The poor Indians (those who are called ministers) come and complain to Mr. Ratcliffe, our minister, that they have nothing allowed them: ... all [Indians] can get is the promise of a coarse coat against winter and [they] would not suffer Aaron, an Indian teacher, to have a bible with the common prayer in it, but took it away from him.

Randolph was not writing about the Vineyard, yet his criticism was valid on the island. A record of money paid by the missionary company to Vineyard men at the time shows that more than half went to "the Magistracy" and "pension."

To Mr. Thomas Mayhue [Governor, age 88 years] £28
To Mr. John Mayhue [Tisbury missionary] £5
To Rulers & Teachers of Martins Vineyard £20 35

Randolph's charges were probably exaggerated, influenced more by his eagerness to serve the King than the truth. He was definitely the King's man, having been quoted as telling the colonists: "It is not to his majesty's interest that you should thrive." But, biased or not, his criticism had some merit. The Commissioners were no longer carefully supervising the way Company funds were spent.

There was also criticism that many Indians were not true converts. They may declare themselves Christian, but were so in form rather than belief. There were doubts, too, about the accuracy of the missionary reports. On the Vineyard, the Mayhews claimed that only one or two Indians remained "pagan." But in 1690, when a "sore fever" prevailed among the Indians, Matthew wrote "... [of the] more than one hundred Adult Persons that dyed, not less than three fourths of the Sober Religious Professors." This suggests that


there were about 25 percent non-professors.


In it, Matthew wrote knowledgeably about the differences among various Indian languages, although at Cambridge he had not learned Algonquin. He described how the Indians organized their government and religion. It is a valuable source document. As one would expect, it is filled with praise for the Mayhew family's success with the Indians. His Vineyard is an integrated paradise with English and Indians existing as brothers in the Lord:

... I have heard some Godly English, their Neighbours, Members of Churches; profess they were troubled, that their unacquaintedness in their Language was such, that they could not well (but otherwise would gladly) partake with them, in the Ordinance of the Lords Supper... Children are generally taught to Read, and many to Write; in one of their Towns the last Winter, &c., 1693, Thirty Children were at School, Twenty more of the same place, at the same time, accidentally, being not supplied with Books, could not attend.

He doesn't mention the rise of the Anabaptists under Stephen Tackamasom, pastor at Chilmark. Tackamasom was a convert from Congregationalism. In only a few years, the Baptists would take over.

Criticism continued over missionary finances. In 1692, a Boston merchant, John Usher, charged that salaries were being paid to ministers who did little or no mission work, and those who did preach could not speak Indian well enough to explain the Gospel. It would be better, he said, if missionaries were paid for each sermon:

Salaries [should] be not given for yearly Service, when perhaps not 12 days in the year anything is done either as to teaching or preaching among them.
The Commissioners did not take his advice, but did recommend that missionaries preach at least 25 sermons a year. There was, of course, no way to enforce that. What took place in the Indian settlements was being reported to the Commissioners only by the missionaries.\textsuperscript{36}

Then in 1698, the New England Company in London decided to get a first-hand account. It paid two ministers who spoke the Indian language, Grindall Rawson of Mendon and Samuel Danforth of Taunton, £46 to visit the Praying Indian settlements in Massachusetts. They visited the islands and reported:

At Major Winthrop's Island [Naushon] Mr. John Weeks, an Englishman, teaches them on the Sabbath. An Indian, named Asa, chief ruler among them, and a person well reported of, teaches them when Mr. Weeks cannot attend it. Here are about nine families, most of which can read well, are diligent in their callings, and generally belong to the church whereof Japhet [Hannit] is pastor, at [Chilmark] Martha's Vineyard. An Indian called [Thomas] Sampson attends their school every winter, and hath the reputation for the most able among them for that service, taking pains in catechizing their children every week. Men, women and children are thirty persons in all. Half the Indian inhabitants of this island have died in a few years past. Three families living at Sconnesset point do attend to the meetings at Mr. Winthrop's Island. At an island called Slocum's island [Nashawena], we hear of several families, most of which can read, being lately moved thither from the Vineyard and other places.

We hear of some Indians at the furthermost island [Cuttyhunk], formerly called Sandford's Island, where there is an Indian teacher.

At Martha's Vineyard, viz., at Chilmark, alias Nashawenamuck: Here is an Indian Church of which Japhet [Hannit] is pastor; a person of the greatest repute for sobriety and religion, and diligent in attending his ministerial employment. Unto whom is adjoined Abel, a ruling elder, who likewise preaches to a part of the church, living at too great a distance ordinarily to attend Japhet's

\textsuperscript{36} Kallaway, pp.231-2. Some years later, Cotton Mather urged the Commissioners to pay "visitors" to travel to the settlements and bring back accurate reports.

ministry; although they come together to attend church administrations.

In this place we find two hundred and thirty one persons; three score and four in full communion. Their children are well instructed as we find by our examination of them in their catechism.

At Ohkonkemme, within the bounds of Tisbury, [Christiantown] are three score and twelve persons unto whom Stephen and Daniel, who are brothers, are preachers, well reported for their gifts and qualifications.

Here we spent part of a Sabbath and were joyful spectators of their Christian and decent carriage; the aforesaid Daniel praying and preaching not only affectionately but understandingly; unto whom we also imparted a word of exhortation in their own language to their contentment and declared satisfaction.\textsuperscript{37}

At Seconkquit [Charles Neck] in Chilmark also, which belongs to the inspection of the aforesaid Stephen and Daniel, are thirty five persons, to whom, for their greater ease, either the one or the other dispenses the word.

At Gayhead, Abel and Elisha are preachers to at least two hundred and sixty souls; who have here at their charge a meeting house already framed. We find that the Indians here, as also may be affirmed of most of the Indians belonging to Martha's Vineyard (Chaubaukeduck excepted) are well instructed in reading, well clothed, and mostly in decent English apparel.

At Edgartown, viz., at Sahachectunkquet [Sengekontacket], are twenty five families, amounting to one hundred and thirty six persons, Job Russell is their minister.

At Nunnepaug about eighty four persons, Joshua Tackquannash their minister, Josiah Thomas, their schoolmaster.

At Chaubaqueduck about one hundred and thirty eight persons. Mannachegn preach to them every Sabbath. Josiah by birth is their ruler or sachem.\textsuperscript{38}

Their report said nothing about any English missionary on the Vineyard, although Experience Mayhew, eldest son

\textsuperscript{37} The Jesuits didn't mention the land disputes then going on at Christiantown. Simon Athearn, who had bought land there from Sachem Josias, was suing Isaac Oram by with trespass. The Indians, in turn, accused Athearn of demolishing their dwellings. It was not the blameless place the report made it appear. See Johnson, p.190ff, for more details.

\textsuperscript{38} MHS Coll. X, 1st Ser., p.129. Copied by Richard L. Pease, DCHS, ms.1, p.91.
They asked the Christian town church to accept him, but the congregation turned him down in 1711, choosing instead the Indian Sonamog. When Sonamog died in 1715, the Commissioners again asked the Indians to accept Experience, but again he was turned down and another Indian, Joash Panu, chosen.

Commissioner Samuel Sewall wrote to London about the turndown:

Although the Indians at the Vineyard, their obstinacy in declining to chuse worthy Mr Experience Mayhew for their Pastor, causes some pain to the Commissioners; yet the unblamable conversation of their country-man Joash Panu, whom they have chosen and ordain'd, gives them Hope that he may become a Blessing in that Place.

Assisting Experience after 1702 was Rev. Josiah Torrey, the new English pastor at (West) Tisbury, whom the Commissioners had paid £20 to learn to speak Indian. He was paid £25 a year as missionary until 1716, when it was increased to £30. Rev. Samuel Wiswall of Nantucket, later English pastor at Edgartown, was also paid to learn Indian, but he seems not to have served as a paid missionary.

Torrey's description of how an Indian church accepted new converts was so well regarded by Revs. Cotton and Increase Mather that they sent it to the London Company:

Their method... is more according to the manner of the churches in the primitive times, than is now practised among the churches in most parts. The person to be admitted [to the church] stands forth in the midst of the assembly, and first makes declaration of his knowledge, and sometimes desires information in things more arduous and doubtful. And then he makes Confession of Sins, which they do (as I have seen) with tears of trembling... And then he gives an account of Experience he has had, of convictions, awakenings, and comforts, in which they are large and

40 John Weeks, son of William Weeks, an early Edgartown settler, went to Naushon about 1700 as tenant farmer on Winthrop's dairy farm, serving parttime as missionary. He was often in debt and was at one time jailed on the Vineyard. Emerson, p.168ff.
Also Winship, pp.109-110.
41 Tisbury Town Records, p.25.
42 Tisbury Town Records, p.38.
particular. After which . . . they are admitted. . . .

The year Experience went on the payroll, 1694, he married the daughter of the last governor of Plymouth, Thomas Hinckley of Barnstable. This marriage into an influential family, no doubt, helped bring him to the attention of the Commissioners, who soon recognized him as someone capable of doing more than preach to a few Indians on Martha's Vineyard. His knowledge of Algonquin (like his father, he learned it as a youth) made him the colony's Indian authority, the role once held by John Eliot. He became a frequent visitor to Boston and a welcome guest in the homes of Boston's religious and political leaders.

Six new Commissioners of the Indians, the colony's agents for the New England Company in London, were appointed at about this time. In the next 20 years, one of them especially would have a great deal to do with the future of the Vineyard Indians. He was Judge Samuel Sewall Jr., who after his appointment wrote in his diary, October 14, 1699:

I meet with the Governour, Lt. Govr., Mr. I. Mather, etc. about the Indian Affair, which is the first time. The Lord make me faithfull and usefull in it. . . .

There was much to be "usefull" about. The status of Gay Head had never been resolved. The Indians didn't know how they stood after Dongan's purchase. Dongan had returned to Ireland where in 1698 he succeeded his brother as Earl of Limerick. His purchase of Gay Head seemed forgotten. Osiah Mattark signed an agreement in 1700 with . . .

There are many correspondences . . . to 1866, p.86. . . . Many Mayhews married off-islanders, beginning in 1661 with Martha Mayhew's marriage to missionary Thomas Tupper Jr., of Sandwich. It is not clear how these marriages flourished. Experience may have met Thankful because Governor Hinckley's sister was the mother of Benjamin Smith, his uncle. Hinckley had just lost his job as Governor of Plymouth when the colony was combined with Massachusetts in 1693.

Sewall Diary, iv, p.502. This was a traumatic, guilt-ridden period in Sewall's life. He had been one of the judges who sentenced 20 Salem "witches" to death in 1692. In 1693, his infant daughter died; in 1695, his mother died; in 1696, a son was stillborn and a second daughter died. Sewall saw these deaths as God's punishment. They were "reiterated strokes of God upon himself and his family," he said in his confession of shame that was read as he stood before the congregation on January 14, 1697. Another new Commissioner, Rev. Cotton Mather, had also taken part in the trials, but expressed no guilt and, incidentally, did not mention his appointment as Commissioner in his diary.

two Boston businessmen leasing land there for mining. The men were authorized to prospect for "any mine and minerals whither of Royall mine or Coper or thinn Copper lead or cole." In return, the natives were to receive half the profit.

We can find no evidence of any mining under this agreement, but its existence indicates that Dongan's ownership was being ignored. But not by everybody. The Athersurn, alway ready to oppose, were unhappy with the purchase, which they called illegal. In March 1700, Matthew Mayhew brought suit against Samuel Athersurn, son of Simon, after Samuel did "publicly, maliciously, and purposely . . . defame sd. Major Mayhew on the third day of Feb., last" by making unfounded charges about the illegal sale of Gay Head to Colonel Dongan by Mayhew.

Sewall, the new broom among the Commissioners, was anxious to do some clean-sweeping. He was bettered by the lack of supervision. Only three of the old group were taking any interest in the work: Increase Mather, Wait Winthrop and William Stoughton. Sewall, his eagerness recognized in London, was appointed Secretary and later Treasurer. He was concerned that the English, while preaching Christianity, seemed to be taking advantage of the Praying Indians in land purchases. As Randolph had written earlier, such behavior would never "convert the Infidels." Sewall went even further in a letter to Sir William Ashhurst, head of the London Company, proposing that reservations be set up "upon which for any English man to encroach, should be accounted a crime." He added:

. . . it will be a vain Attempt for us to offer Heaven to them, if they take up prejudices against us, as if we did grudge them a Living upon their own Earth.


53 Matthew had had other problems. On Dec.10,1700, he wrote to Wait Winthrop, explaining why he hadn't gone to Boston: ". . . especially remembering how small a matter of getting cold last month brought me so near Death." Emerson, p.162.

54 Stoughton was about to resign. Johnson, p.205.
Early in 1702, Samuel Sewall decided to go to the Vineyard to see what was being done with the money he was paying out. Wait Winthrop, also a Commissioner and owner of Naushon island, alerted Matthew Mayhew to the coming visit. The Commissioners were reviewing Matthew's request for a salary increase at the time:

Capt. Sewall told me but now that he intended to go to the Vineyard after the Court is over to make enquiry after the Indian affairs, and the matter about your salary I understand is deferred till after he comes home again (for I being not well was not at the last meeting) he says he designs to go to the old towne [Edgartown] and then to the New [Tisbury], doubtless he will find better entertainment at your brother's or where you may advise otherwise... if Capt. Sewall goes I would by no means have you not accompany him. You are capable to inform him better than anybody as to the Xian town [Christiantown] and if I am in health I hope some time in May to be at the island and shall endeavor to see you...

On his way to the Vineyard, Sewall stopped at the Barnstable home of Governor Hinckley, who read him a letter from daughter Thankful, now Mrs. Experience Mayhew. She had just given birth to a son. Sewall must have gone away feeling warm about the missionary, whom Reverend Cotton had praised in his sermon the year before.

Leaving Barnstable at 7:30 a.m., the next day he went to Cotuit on a new road that followed an Indian footpath from Barnstable to Suckessett (Falmouth). They rested at Isaac Robinson's tavern in Suckessett:

...Call at Mr. Robinson's. They give us good Small Beer. Go to the Ferryhouse; his Boat is at little Woods's hole; travel thither, there embark, and have a good passage over in little more than an hour's time. Refresh at Chases, from thence ride to Tisbury. First man I speak with is Joseph Dagget [Dagget]; he tells me Mr. Cathcart [Cathcart] keeps an Ordinary; we go thither, the Day-Light being almost spent...  

---

52 Chase's was a tavern in Holmes Hole. Cathcart's was in (West) Tisbury, either near the cemetery or next to Alley's Store. Cathcart ran taverns at both places at different times. He was a Scot, hence Scotchman's Bridge Lane.

April 7... visit Major [Matthew] Mayhew, then Experience, whose wife lyes in of a Son. Dine at Majr. Mayhew's, then ride to the Gay-head Neck, to Abel's Wigwam, where was pleased with the goodness of his house, especially the Furniture... Two great Spinning Wheels, one small one for Linnen, and a Loom to weave it. When Abel came in from his sowing of Wheat, I discoursed him to mutual satisfaction. He gave us very good Milk and Water to drink... saw an English House of [Indian] Harry... saw four good Oxen which belonged to one Indian... Abel says there are Fifty-Eight houses in the Gay-head Neck. Majr. Mayhew says 'twill Entertain 58 more, and less than forty Rod of Fence takes it in — 1.1. Acres. Two Schoolmasters chiefly for Winter, Jonas Hassawit, the Anabaptist preacher, and Peter Chamin... our Quarters at Mr. Allen's, where sup with Sheriff, his wife, Majr. Mayhew, Mr. Torrey, Exp. Mayhew. Have a very good Chamber and Bed to lodge in, one of the best in Chilmark. April 8. Japhet, Jonathan and Stephen [Indian preachers] come to me. I... try to convince Stephen of his Anabaptistical Errors. Jonas and he have a Church of about 30, ten men. Mr. Exp. Mayhew proposes... [a] short Treatise be drawn up and translated into Indian to prevent the spreading of the Anabaptistical Notions. Mr. Thacher [minister of Chilmark] and Mr. Thomas Mayhew and Mr. [Simon] Athern accompany me in my way towards Edgartown. Dine at Mr. Athern's, his wife not 14 when he married her... Get to the Town [Edgartown] about 3 p.m. Lodge at Sarsons. 45

April 9. Breakfast at Major Mayhew's. Major Mayhew and his Brother accompany us to Chase's, where we meet with Mr. Exp. Mayhew and Mr. Allen the Sheriff. Chase's Boat not come. By the time I got over 'twas near sunset. Madam Hinckley embarked in the boat and brought us over to visit

---

53 Banks, v.III shows no children born to Experience and Thankful in 1701/1702. This may have been Samuel, their only son, who Banks shows as born in 1700. His birth is not listed in Island Vital Records.
54 Torrey, Tisbury minister, and Experience were both on Sewall's payroll. Matthew Mayhew was agent of Dungar, owner of Gay Head. Sewall was lodging at Sheriff Ebenezer Allen's ordinary. Allen later became a tenant on the Company's land at Gay Head. Jonas Hassawit was the Indian who would confide to forging Merrick's declaration the following year. Today, we would suspect conspiracy.
55 Richard Sarson was Matthew Mayhew's brother-in-law and lived on what is now Water St., Edgartown. He died the following year.
her daughter Lying in. 56
April 10. Sam. [his son] and I rode alone to Sandwich, very
good Rode. Bait at Mr. Chipman's 57 Lodge at Capt.
Morey's. [Saturday] Got home about 9: too late; were
well and found all well. Lais Deo.

Sewall, no doubt, reported his trip to London, probably
mentioning his concern about the Anabaptists and the
steady encroachment on Indian land. Letters from London
became increasingly critical on these points. Sir Thomas
Ashhurst, secretary of the Company, wrote to Sewall on
March 19, 1703:

... we formerly mentioned... the Great Scandal which
we conceived the Indians might take at the unjust
encroachment of the English upon their lands, so we cannot
but repeat our concern that so base a thing should be done
by them that pretend to be Christians...

We are not a little concerned to understand that the
Anabaptists are sowing their Wares amongst the Converted
Indians. It must stagger their faith when they perceive the
diversitie of opinions amongst Christians... If some
Effectual Measure be not taken for preventing this growing
Evil, I am much afraid we shall meet with little success
in our Indian missions.

Ashhurst was also concerned about the regular practice
of using Company funds to augment the salaries of ministers
of English churches who rarely preached to the Indians. He
wrote to Reverend Mather:

... the money that was remitted for propagating the Gospell
in New England among the Indians could not be applied
to the maintenance of ministers among the English who
neither understood the Language nor concerned themselves
in the Indian work and this we desire might for the future
be rectified.

In 1706, the Commissioners asked Judge Sewall once again
to visit the Vineyard, this time with Edward Bromfield,
Boston merchant, and Rev. Samuel Danforth of Taunton,

56 Mrs. Experience Mayhew and baby seem now to be on the mainland with her family,
the Hinckleys.
57 To bait is to feed and water the horse.

from Gay Head that the Indians were being molested and
"threatened to be Ousted" by the English. 58

Sewall's diary again describes the trip:

Sept'r. 2. Embarked for the Vineyard: but by stormy rough
wether were forc'd back again to Wood's Hole. Lodg'd at
B. Skiff's, he shew'd me the Bay, and Mr. Weeks's Harbour.
Sept'r. 3. Went to the Vineyard with a fair wind, and from
Home's Hole to Tisbury and I to Chilmark, to Mr. Allen's.
Sept'r. 4. To Gayhead, Mr. Danforth, I, Mr. Tho. Mayhew,
Major Basset. 59
Sept'r. 5. Din'd at Mr. Mayhew's: went to Home's Hole
to wait for a Passage to Rode-Island, or Bristol. There lay
windbound.

Sept'r. 8. Mr. Danforth and I go to Tisbury Meeting, Mr.
Josia Torrey preach'd forenoon: Mr. Danforth after Noon.
Return'd to Chases to Mr. Bromfield.

Sept'r. 9. Monday, embark'd with a scant wind: put in to
Tarpoling Cove: Mr. Bromfield not yielding to go to
Cushnet. There spake with Darby who shew'd us the
prisoners Fines: Spake with Mr. Weeks. 60

Sept'r. 10. Gave the Squaw that has lost her seat, Ten
pounds of Wool. When the Tide serv'd, sail'd for Cushnet,
had a good passage...

This time Sewall made no mention of meeting Experience
Mayhew. He did meet with Thomas Mayhew (III) and heard
Reverend Torrey preach, but nothing is said about his
principal missionary. It must have been that Experience was
not on the Vineyard. Only two weeks later, his wife,
Thankful Hinckley, died at age 33, perhaps at her parents'
home in Barnstable. That would explain his absence. Surely,
had he been on the Vineyard he would have met with
Sewall. 61

58 It isn't clear what prompted it, but Governor Dudley of Mass., at this time appointed
Thomas Butler to be Captain of the Indians of the Vineyard and ordered him to "Lead,
Order and Exercise the said Indians in Armes and to keep them in good Order and
Discipline..."
59 Bromfield, who had been injured in a carriage upset on the trip to Wood's Hole,
remained at Chase's ordinary.
60 John Weeks, as we have seen, was a paid missionary on Naushon.
61 It isn't clear where Thankful died. A stone in the West Tisbury cemetery marks her
gaze, but her body may have been brought here. Experience was left with three young
children, one of whom, Samuel, was mentally retarded. Johnson, fn. p.203.
After this second visit to the Island, Sewall wrote to London, recommending Gay Head as the ideal place for his proposed Indian reservation:

The Gayhead Neck is the Westernmost end of the Island, so called from a high Cliff, which by reason of its white, black, yellow colors makes a glistening shew to those that pass by. This Neck affords a convenient Recess for the Indians, that they may live comfortably and inoffensively.

He explained that the land, now owned by Dongan, was used by the English for sheep grazing, something the Indians looked at as encroachment. Because the Neck was totally surrounded by water, sheep ran free. This meant, Sewall explained, that when a sheep disappeared, the Indians were accused of stealing it. If the Company would buy the land from Lord Limerick, he argued, and create an Indian reservation, it would end this quarrelsome situation and also keep them secure from English encroachment.

When Jeremiah Dummer, agent in London for Massachusetts, left for England, Sewall urged him to argue for his proposal:

Be sure, doe your Uttermost, to persuade my Lord Limerick to make a Release of the Gay Head Neck on Martha's Vineyard to the Indian Inhabitants there; who are brought under a good Orderly Christian Regulation: and will be ruined, if turned off [the Neck].

Sewall's suggestion was well received in London as Secretary Ashhurst responded:

... the Corporation has considered what you write about the Indian Settlement at Grayhead [sic] neck in Martha's Vineyard and will take care if my Lord Limerick have not disposed of his Title to make some proposals to him for it, but as you say that there is a Paramount Title to his, if it be vested in anybody on your side the Corporation would have the Commissioners purchase it of them and we shall be better able to deal with my Lord. In such case [Limerick] will be brought rather to accept of a moderate price than contend titles with us; he is a good humored man

and tho' a Papist will not be difficult to be brought to reason, but our Misfortune is, he is now in Portugal.

Dongan's stay in Portugal must have been an extended one because four years passed before the Gay Head purchase was accomplished. On May 10, 1711, Sir William Ashhurst wrote the good news to Sewall:

The Corp. has thought fit in pursuance of a former Resolution taken some years ago at your Instance to [negotiate] with the Earl of Limerick for his Interest in the Island of Martha's Vineyard and by [Divine] Interposition we have perfected a bargain with him. The Consideration amounts to 550 pounds which, upon sealing the writings, was paid down...

Matthew Mayhew, who had set up Gay Head as a separate entity, was not alive to see what had happened. He had died the year before. Thomas Dongan, now Earl of Limerick, had made a profit: he had paid Matthew £200 and Mataack another £30 for land he sold for £550. The Commissioners were pleased: the land was said to be worth £5000. Samuel Sewall had his reservation for the Indians. Everybody, it would seem, had come out ahead.

Everybody, that is, except the Indians.

(To be concluded)

CORRECTION

Alan Reckie of Oak Bluffs, a careful reader and a Scot who knows English history, has pointed out an error in the article entitled "A Puzzling Piracy off Tarpaulin Cove," November 1991 issue. Queen Mary, of William and Mary fame, was King James's daughter, not his sister, as stated by the author, who is most grateful for the correction.
May 1828

1st. WSW, rainy. Went to Christians-
town on business of Inds.
2nd. S to SSW. Went to Chappaquidick on business of Inds.
3rd. S to SSW. Engaged on business of Indians.
   [For the next six days, the same entry as above.] 8th. SW. Miss Ann F. Coffin dies of a consumption.
10th. ENE. Finished business of the Indians at Chappaquidick at present. J.H. & T.F. Esq's go home this day. 11th. ESE. Br. Lambert of Nantucket Preaches.
12th. S. Preparing to go to Boston today. Sail for N. Bedford. Remain in Boston from the 13th to the 23rd. Arrive in N.B. 23rd & home the 24th.
26th. SW. Went to Christian Town on business of the Indians. Engaged from this day till the 4th of June on the above business with J. Hancock & Thos. Fish, Esqs. Much rain about these days.

June 1828

4th. SW, foggy. Return from Christian Town.
5th. SSW, foggy. Engaged in business of the Indians 1/2 day.
6th. SW, foggy, AM, PM clear. Engaged on business as above 1/2 day.

7th. ditto 1/2 day. Hauled up the Revenue boat.
9th. SSW, pleasant. Gen'L Dearborn arrives in the Revenue Cutter, Capt. Trivett, from Boston for the purpose of viewing the contemplated place for a causeway & Lighthouse at the mouth of our Harbour. 11th. NE. Engaged in painting the Methodist Meeting House 1/2 day. Fogy PM.
16th. SW. Engaged in painting the Methodist Meeting House.
18th. SW, foggy. Very remarkable wet weather for a length of time past.
21st SSW, light, pleasant. Engaged on Indian business all day.
22nd. SSW. Brother Jotham Horton preaches his farewell sermon.
23rd. SW. Painted the Revenue Boat.
24th. SW. Rev'd. Jotham Horton & Family leaves us today for a visit to his Friends in Duxbury & Boston, having laboured with us for 15 or 16 months during which time a number have been.
3rd. Rev'd. was Superintendent of Lighthouses for the district with headquarters in Boston. Apparently it was intended at the start to connect the lighthouse with the shore by causeway, but what was built was a bridge.
4th. The meetinghouse is now the Edgartown Town Hall on Main Street.
5th. The channel between Chappaquidick and Muskeget Island (Nantucket), with its numerous shoals, was not usually used by such large vessels. Fanny Worth is the sister of Eliza Pease, Jeremiah's wife. She later married Thomas M. Coffin.

June 1828

2nd. Wind SW. Launched the Revenue Boat.
4th. Wind SW. Sail'd to Cape with My Wife & several of our connections & friends.

Rev. Horton had replaced Reformation John Adams as Methodist minister in Edgartown. See Intelligencer, Feb. 1991, for details. Like many island families, the Peases were split over religion. Jeremiah had switched to Methodism, his parents continued as Congregationalists, the church of Rev. Martin (Martyn). Jeremiah wishes them well.

7th. John Sprague was son of Capt. John and Mary Mayhew Sprague of Edgartown. He had moved to Salem, N.Y.
8th. Rarely do Jeremiah and Eliza go somewhere together. Even rarer is any such recreational outing. This was the Fourth of July.
5th. Wind NE. Engaged at the Methodist Meetinghouse 1 day.  
6th. Wind SW. Painting inside Methodist Meetinghouse 1 day.  
9th. Ditto. 1/2 day.  
10th. Ditto. 1/2 day.  
14th. Wind SSW. Went to Tisbury on my business.  
15th. Wind S, rainy. The new Congregational Meeting house raised.  
17th. SW. Brother A.D. Pease's wife had a Daut., born this night or Morn's.  
18th. SW. Went to Tisbury, attended the auct. of sale of the Capt. [?] Land at Christian town. Returned at evening.  
21st. SW. Set out for Boston. Went to Metapotiset & N.Bed.  
22nd. SW. Went to Boston.  
23rd. SW. Went from Boston to Lynn to the Methodist Conference, had a pleasant Visit, returned to Boston.  
26th. Wind SW, warm. Mr. Wm. Cooke's child dies aged ___.  
28th. Wind SW. Scrubbed the Revenue boat's bottom.

August 1828

1st. SSW. Engaged in taking out salt at the point.  
9th. Jeremiah underlined "my business." No hint as to what it was. He was a cordwainer as well as a surveyor.  
10th. This is now the Federated Church in Edgartown. These were busy days: two large churches being built at same time.  
11th. The baby was Sarah A. Pease, daughter of Abner Pease.  
12th. There seems to be no other record of this child.  
13th. Jeremiah worked for Thomas Cooke, tending his saltworks on Starbuck's Neck.

We have much cause of gratitude to God for his direction, Support and protection, in all matters relative to this Meetinghouse, Eternity will only bring them all to light. Bless the Lord, Oh, my Soul.

Capt. Winslow Lewis arrives with a number of men to build the Lighthouse at the mouth of our harbour.  
11th. SW. Capt. Lewis commences work.  
14th. SW. Capt. Lewis commences setting Piles for the Lighthouse at the mouth of the Harbour or on the Flats. The Spire & Fan[e] [weather vane] set on the Steple of the Cong're Meetinghouse.  
20th. NW. This day the Methodist Episcopal Society meet for the choice of Trustees etc., having been lately Incorporated.  
22nd. SW. Took out 111 bushels salt.  
26th. SW. Boarded Brig Pilot Milton from Phila.  
27th. NE. Ship Maridian arrives from Pea-chester New.  
28th. SW. Sloop Thomas, Brs. C. & A.D. Pease Sails for Boston.  

September 1828

1st. SW. Went to Tisbury to Probate court.  
2nd. My Wife & Sisters go to Chappaquidick.  
3rd. S. The Lighthouse at the mouth of the harbour & Capt. Peter M. Coffin's house raised this day.  
6th. NNE. Engage surveying land at Chappaquidick.  
8th. SW. Went to H. Hole to survey land for James Cottle. Met at Mr. Thaxter's Academy on acct. of Sing School.  
10th. NNE. Met at the Academy.  

[Next four entries show him attending to Indian business, 1/2 day each.]

17th. NE, gail. This day a young man named Aaron Young of the Town of _____, State of Maine, is taken out of the harbour, having fallen overboard from the Schooner Gleener. Packet of this place, on Saterdy night or Sunday morning last. A Coroner's Inquest is held upon him. Vindict, accidental death by drowning. He was said to be much intoxicated when last.

19th. Today's West Tisbury. It and Edgartown alternated as the County seat during these years. The Court House was near the intersection of Old County Road and Edgartown West Tisbury Road.

20th. Capt. Coffin had recently married Margaret, daughter of Keeper Matthew Mayhew, the first keeper of Cape Page Light. We can't identify this house. Capt. Coffin's second wife was Susan (Norton) Fisher. He moved to New York state some years later.

21st. Jeremiah was to become a Methodist chorister. The singing school was held at Thaxter's Academy, Summer Street and Davis Lane, Edgartown.
seen alive. Funeral service by the Rev’d. T.D. Peirce. His Corps was carried to the Methodist meetinghouse. Engaged on Indian business 1/2 day. Meeting this evening at Mr. Thaxter’s Academy for consulting about a Singing school. Conclude to use our endeavors to obtain a Singing Master. 18th. Wind NE. Hawldup the Revenue Boat for the purpose of painting her. Sloop Wm. & Mary arrives from the Sts. of Bellisle. 19th. NE. Gall. Schr. Rising Sun arrives from the Straights of Bellisle. 20th. NE. Sloop Pacific, Cap. Mills, arrives from the Sts.

22nd. NE. Engaged on Ind. busines 1 day. J. Hancock Esq. comes down. 23rd. SSE, light. Engage on Ind. busin. 1 day. Mr. Mitchell, the Agent of the Ship Howard of Nantucket, dies very suddenly this morning at about 2 o’clock. His Friends send his Corps to Nantucket.

24th. SSW, rainy. Thos. Fish Esq. arrives from Palmer to attend to the Indian business. Engaged on that business 1 day. 25th. SSW, rainy. Ditto 1 Day. 26th. WSW. Finished our business at Chappequidic. 1 day.

27th. S, rainy. Engaged in making or writing Report 1 day. 29th. ENE rainy. Went to Christianstown. Finished our business 1 day and signed our Report there.

22 Aaron Young was from Sanford, Maine.
23 The Straits of Belle Isle are between Newfoundland and Labrador. Why so much traffic with that area is unclear, unless they were hauling lumber to restock the lumber yard, depleted by the construction of two churches and the lighthouse.

dated this day. Storm. Returned at night. Court C.P. sets at Edgtr. today. 30th. NE. Engaged about the Lighthouse.

October 1828
1st. Wind SSE. Engaged at the lighthouse. The workman finish today. I certified the Contract by request of Gen’l. H.A.S. Dearborn, superintendent of Lighthouses for Massachusetts, dated this day, wrote a letter to him upon the subject. See Copy on file. Court adjourns this day.

2nd. SE, storm A.M. At 12 o’clock Cap. Lazarus Bowkis (?) delivers me the key of the Lighthouse. He & his workmen go to N.Bedford about 1 o’clock.


5th. ESE, stormy. Ship John, Capt. Jethro Daggett, arrives from the Pacific Ocean into H.Hole.

6th. NNW to WNW. Ship John arrives in our Harbour, cargo 2000 BBs Sperm Oil, a very important arrival for the Town.

Painted the I. [lighthouse] boat.

7th. SW, fresh breeze. Sloop Hero sails for Boston. Ship John comes up to Thos. Mayhew’s Wharf.

24 The lighthouse was completed in six weeks, including setting the spiles upon which it stood, about a quarter mile offshore on the site of today’s Edgartown light. It was a two-story house with its lantern on the roof.
25 His comment suggests there were many in town who owned shares in the ship and would be pleased with its full load of sperm oil.
26 Mayhew’s wharf, at the foot of Mayhew Lane, was later known as the Coal Wharf.

Jeremiah Pease Describes the 1828 Dedication Of the New Methodist Meeting House in Edgartown

5 W. Rev. Thomas E. Peirce arrives from Charleton via Boston, to preach the Methodist Society. Rev. John Lindsey arrives, thence Elam, of the District, to preach the Dedication Sermon at the spring of our new Methodist Meetinghouse.

6 W. Dedication service commences at 2 o’clock PM.


Minister Rev. Mr. Brown, Mr. Marshall, Mr. Peirce.

Minister Rev. Mr. Brown, Mr. Marshall, Mr. Peirce.

Minister the congregation was large, the Pews being filled and many in the lecture room.

Sermon by Rev. John Lindsey from 1st Cor. 12:12, concluding prayer by Rev. Elam.

Rev. Elam: The services of the day and evening were solemn and interesting. After the afternoon service the Pews were sold to the great satisfaction of the Society and their Friends.

1st. Quarterly Meeting this day, in very pleasing and liberal season. Many of our British ancestors from the other parts of the island were present.

We have much cause of gratitude to see this event, a new and public, in all respects relative to the Methodist Quarterly, will only bring them all to light. Being the Lord’s money.

The August 8, 9, and 10 entries by Jeremiah Pease in his diary describe the 1828 dedication services for the new church building (now the Edgartown Town Hall). "After the afternoon service, the Pews were sold to the great satisfaction of the Society & their Friends." (Also see footnote 14, p. 166)
### Payroll and Expenses of Indian Missions in 1680

**All account of the Commission of the United Colonies at Boston. Rev. 1680**

| To the Major General Gration | £ 15.00.00 |
| To Mr. John Elliott | £ 15.00.00 |
| To Teachers & Rulers under him | £ 10.00.00 |
| To Major Kingley of Plymouth Colony | £ 16.00.00 |
| To Schoolmasters in Plymouth Colony | £ 1.50.00 |
| To Mr. Bourne | £ 25.00.00 |
| To Teachers & Rulers | £ 25.00.00 |
| To a Sacrist Teacher | £ 1.20.00 |
| To Mr. John Cotton | £ 20.00.00 |
| To a Sacrist Teacher | £ 1.10.00 |
| To Mr. Thomas Mayhew | £ 28.00.00 |
| To Mr. John Mayhew | £ 5.00.00 |
| To Mr. Tread | £ 5.00.00 |
| To Rulers & Teachers of Martha's Vineyard | £ 20.00.00 |
| To Rulers & Teachers at Nantucket | £ 12.00.00 |
| To Mr. James Pitch | £ 1.30.00 |
| To Major John Pinchon | £ 10.00.00 |
| To a Teacher at Mattapoisett | £ 1.00.00 |
| To the Christian Indians of Plymouth Colony as part of the £200 due for their service in the late Warr | £ 10.00.00 |
| To Bible of the Massachusetts Colony | £ 10.00.00 |
| To Bible of Connecticut Colony | £ 4.00.05.06 |
| To sundry particulars since first bill for Ammunition, paper, cloths, etc. &c. | £ 43.15.06 |
| To Pay Charges for lace & pattern | £ 1.00.00 |

**£ 350.19.00**

The salaries and other expenses paid by the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in 1680 are shown on this report. Included are Thomas Mayhew, the Governor, John Mayhew, the missionary, and “Rulers & Teachers of Martha's Vineyard.”